

Coroner's Inquests into the London Bombings of 7 July 2005
Hearing transcripts - 18 October 2010 - Afternoon session

1 (2.00 pm)

2 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Mr Keith?

3 MR KEITH: Steven Desborough, please.

4 MR STEVEN DESBOROUGH (sworn)

5 Questions by MR KEITH

6 MR KEITH: Is your name Steven Desborough?

7 A. That's correct.

8 Q. Mr Desborough, I want to ask you, of course, about the
9 events of July 2005. That morning, you travelled to
10 London from Walthamstow Central railway station and
11 I think you intended to catch the mainline train, but
12 you missed it, and so you then instead took the Tube to
13 King's Cross underground station?

14 A. That's correct, so I missed it.

15 Q. On the Victoria Line?

16 A. The Victoria Line, yes, I missed it by a couple of
17 seconds.

18 Q. You changed there on to the Circle line?

19 A. That's correct, at King's Cross.

20 Q. You were intending to travel, were you, to Tower Hill?

21 A. That's correct, yes.

22 Q. You walked, I think, to the far end of the platform at
23 King's Cross. So when the train arrived, it meant that
24 you would be standing immediately next to the last
25 carriage of the train?

1 A. Yes, that's correct.

2 Q. We know that to be the sixth carriage.

3 A. That's correct.

4 Q. Is that the carriage that you boarded?

5 A. Yes, it was.

6 Q. I needn't trouble you, I think, with where you were in

7 the sixth carriage because obviously the sixth carriage

8 was not essentially concerned with the events we are

9 engaged in looking at. But there came time, shortly

10 after the train had pulled out of Liverpool Street

11 station on its way to Aldgate that there was a huge

12 white flash and a loud bang?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. I think you instinctively put your head between your

15 knees to protect yourself?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Did all the lights go out?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And were you plunged into complete darkness?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. The train shuddered to an abrupt halt, you told the

22 police, and I think everybody in your carriage was

23 shaking in the sense that they were jolted to a sudden

24 stop?

25 A. Yes, yes.

1 Q. Was there any screaming in your carriage?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Did the period of pitch darkness pass and you became
4 aware that there was some sort of lighting?

5 A. Yes, there was light coming from the tunnel that we was
6 in on the far wall across the opposite rails, which was
7 behind me at the time.

8 Q. Could you tell whether the lights had always been on or
9 whether they had come on at some point after the
10 explosion?

11 A. I think they -- I believe they come on after the
12 explosion.

13 Q. Did your carriage fill up with thick, dark smoke?

14 A. Yes, it did.

15 Q. I think people started coughing and covering their faces
16 as the carriage filled with smoke.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. It's a testament to human fortitude and coolness under
19 fire, I think, one or two people took a humorous
20 approach, told a joke or two, but certainly everybody
21 kept calm?

22 A. Yes, in my carriage obviously there was raised eyebrows,
23 a few questions asked, people asked "Well, what could it
24 be?" and everything, but, yes, it was relatively calm in
25 the sixth carriage.

1 Q. However, did you start to hear screaming?
2 A. There was, at some point, a few screams that were heard
3 from where we were.
4 Q. Could you tell from which direction they came?
5 A. Yes, further up the train.
6 Q. Towards the front?
7 A. Towards the front on my right-hand side.
8 Q. You took out your mobile phone at one stage and saw what
9 the time was?
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. Was that around the same time as you began to hear
12 screaming from the other carriage or further up the
13 train, or later?
14 A. It's probably just a little bit before, but we are only
15 talking moments.
16 Q. Do you recall what that time was?
17 A. I remember looking at my phone. It was 51 minutes past.
18 Q. Amongst the screaming, could you hear screams for help,
19 so particular words "Help" and calls for medical
20 assistance or doctors?
21 A. I heard screams for help, but mostly it was just
22 screams. Somebody from my carriage did ask if there was
23 a medic on board, but after looking down the carriage,
24 I couldn't see anyone on my carriage that was actually
25 injured or anything like that. It was a bit more

1 panic-stricken than anything.

2 Q. We know there came a time when the passengers in all the
3 other carriages, excluding those from the rear of
4 carriage 2, came to be decanted from the train by the
5 rear. Do you remember that happening in your case?

6 A. Yes, I do.

7 Q. Can you assist us with how long you think after the
8 explosion you were invited to move towards the rear door
9 of the train and then exit through the driver's cab?

10 A. Okay, I wouldn't have thought it was more than ten
11 minutes. Like everyone said here so far today, and
12 I know it seems to be a bit of a cliché, but time down
13 there, it didn't appear to be relevant as such. It was
14 the longest day of my life, it was also the quickest as
15 well, but, yes, it was within -- it was around the
16 10-minute mark that I left the carriage.

17 Q. We'll come in a moment to your description of who was
18 standing at the rear of the train helping you to exit,
19 to alight from it. Before then, had you seen members of
20 the London Underground staff or other emergency service
21 personnel on the track alongside your carriage?

22 A. I saw them behind me coming up. I could see some
23 movement but, where it was dark and where it was smoky
24 as well, you could see figures and I could see the
25 colour of their jackets as well and I could see, like,

1 their emblem with the underground staff. So I could see
2 they were there, and then briefly after that they had
3 made their way to the back of the train and opened up
4 the cabin doors, the cab doors.

5 Q. Were they the first people whom you saw outside the
6 carriage on the tracks, as you say, in their high
7 visibility jackets?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. London Underground staff. You exited via the driver's
10 cab down some steps, which plainly a member of the
11 London Underground staff had placed there for you.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Before you left the train, had other passengers come
14 through your carriage from carriages 3, 4 and 5 and
15 alighted -- exited first --

16 A. No.

17 Q. -- or were you amongst the first people off the train?

18 A. I was one of the first people off the train, I believe.

19 Q. You exited off the train. You would have turned sharp
20 left and gone back on yourself, back up the track, to
21 Aldgate?

22 A. That's correct, yes.

23 Q. Sharp left in order to get on to the other rails which
24 were empty going in the other direction. The train was
25 on a bend and the first part of the train that you saw

1 was undamaged.

2 A. Yes, ie carriages 5, 4, as I was walking up.

3 Q. Could you see, as you walked along the track, debris or
4 pieces of metal alongside the stopped train?

5 A. Yes, I could.

6 Q. Can you tell us, please, something about that?

7 A. As we approached carriage 3 and 2, in that order, at
8 first the debris was quite small. As we made our way
9 towards the carriages, the debris got larger, and at one
10 point we was having to actually climb over it while
11 walking on the rails. I had to help -- there was two
12 middle-aged ladies that were on my carriage with me at
13 the time. They left the carriage with me and I helped
14 them across the debris in the lead-up to carriage 3
15 and 2.

16 Q. As you approached carriage 2, was it absolutely apparent
17 to you that the carriage had been destroyed insofar as
18 the windows had all been blown out and the doors were
19 ripped open?

20 A. It was obliterated, yes.

21 Q. Was it quiet?

22 A. Eerily quiet.

23 Q. What did you do, Mr Desborough, at that stage?

24 A. I realised that I see something was up, I dropped my
25 sports holdall that I had on my shoulder and walked over

1 across the debris to the carriage and stood at the end
2 of carriage 2 and looked in the doors and shouted out
3 "Does anyone need any help?"
4 Q. Could we please have on the screen INQ8373 [INQ8373-1]? If you
5 could enlarge please, the bottom carriage.
6 Mr Desborough, we have there the second carriage.
7 A. Mm-hmm.
8 Q. Can you see in the bottom left-hand corner the words
9 "looked through, but couldn't enter"?
10 A. That's correct, yes. On D8.
11 Q. To get our bearings, that is towards the rear of the
12 second carriage, so the right-hand side of the screen is
13 the front. You were walking from left to right?
14 A. That's correct, yes.
15 Q. And you were on this side, the bottom side of the screen
16 as we look at it?
17 A. That's correct, yes.
18 Q. So the first door of the second carriage, the first door
19 that you approached, was, in fact, the door adjacent to
20 the bomb?
21 A. Yes, but I didn't know that at the time.
22 Q. As it transpired.
23 A. Yes.
24 Q. Is that the door that you then looked through as you've
25 told us?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. You called out. Was there a response?

3 A. Yes, there was a female voice that asked for help,
4 a lady of around about 40. She was blackened. Yes, and
5 she was standing in the corner of the carriage, around
6 about seats 16 and 15.

7 Q. Have you marked on the diagram where you believed her to
8 be?

9 A. Yes, that's --

10 Q. You subsequently discovered, did you not, that she was
11 a doctor?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And it may be that you subsequently discovered that her
14 name was Elizabeth Quaghebeur?

15 A. Only the other day, yes.

16 Q. I'm so sorry, I've said Elizabeth Quaghebeur.
17 Gerardine Quaghebeur. My mistake, Gerardine Quaghebeur.
18 As you looked through the door, could you see
19 anybody moving?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Where?

22 A. As I stood in D8, the step of the train as you would
23 enter would be at my chest level. In front of me is
24 what appeared to be a young chap laying with his head
25 towards seat 19 and his feet towards seat 18 across the

1 doorway.

2 Q. Can you remember anything about the clothes that that
3 young chap was wearing?

4 A. Yes, I believe he had a blue shirt on. It was hard to
5 tell because of how dark it was and, also, they were
6 lacking clothing.

7 Q. The clothes were shredded and destroyed by the blast?

8 A. That's correct. I also looked into the carriage and
9 I saw things, but I just -- at the time, it was very
10 hard to comprehend. One minute I was going to work,
11 going about my daily business on a routine day, like
12 every Londoner does, keep their heads down, and then,
13 all of a sudden, you're faced with this and you're
14 trying to make head nor tail from it, and it was quite
15 hard.

16 Q. I understand.

17 A. I saw a set of legs standing upright that appeared to be
18 just cut off below the knee.

19 Q. Just pause there. Was that set of legs very close to
20 where you had seen the man in the blue shirt?

21 A. It was more towards the centre of the carriage.

22 Q. Still in the location of what we now know to be the
23 bomb?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Still between those doors, D7 and D8?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. The man who was wearing the blue shirt but whose clothes
3 had been shredded or destroyed by the blast, you say he
4 was moving?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Could you see which part of him was moving?

7 A. He seemed to be frozen in some type of state, with his
8 knees up slightly and his arms in, almost in a foetal
9 position but not as tight, and every so often he would
10 give out a loud cry and he would also kick out as well,
11 start moving his arms and his legs and rolling around on
12 the floor there, which I did my best to calm him down.
13 I couldn't reach to actually see over him and see what
14 proper injuries that he had. I couldn't actually
15 administer first aid, because where I was --

16 Q. Because you were still standing where you were?

17 A. Yes, I was still outside the carriage at this point.

18 Q. But I think you told the police that you were able to
19 reach in to a sufficient extent to be able to touch him,
20 to stroke his back and to try to calm him?

21 A. Yes, and try to comfort him.

22 Q. Offer consolation to him?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You've told us that he made a noise. Was he able to
25 form any particular words that you recognised or, to use

1 the technical expression, to verbalise the noise that he
2 was making?

3 A. There was nothing coherent that he said. It was more
4 screams of pain than anything.

5 Q. So that was the man in the blue shirt, and you've made
6 reference to the fact that you saw a set of legs very
7 close nearby?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. In your police statement, you told the police that it
10 seemed to you as if those legs had become detached from
11 a body.

12 A. From a body.

13 Q. That's your recollection, is it, you weren't able to see
14 the upper body of the person to whom those legs may have
15 belonged?

16 A. Nothing that was obvious, no.

17 Q. Mr Desborough the scene that confronted you was
18 obviously, as you've described, one of darkness, albeit
19 lit dimly by the tunnel lights. There was still
20 presumably some degree of smoke. The floor was
21 a picture of devastation, glass, blood, personal
22 possessions and human bodies. Is that a fair summary?

23 A. That's correct, yes.

24 Q. The lady whom you saw in the carriage, did she give you
25 any information? Did she tell you whether, for example,

1 she had made any checks of those who were alive in the
2 carriage or did she tell you how many people she
3 believed may have died?

4 A. Yes, she did. She shouted out to me, she believed that
5 there were two dead and she was still getting around the
6 carriage to try to check on other people.

7 Q. Were you able to tell whether or not the people to whom
8 she was making reference -- the people whom she said
9 were dead -- included, for example, the second person
10 whom you saw but whose legs only you saw?

11 A. She never gave us any reference to who was dead.

12 Q. Right. And you responded by telling her, I think, that
13 you were a first aider?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. I appreciate again, it's very difficult to answer this
16 question and you've referred to this already, but can
17 you tell us as best you can how much time had elapsed by
18 the time that you were standing next to the carriage and
19 looking in through doors D8?

20 A. It would have only been a minute or so since I left the
21 back of carriage 6.

22 Q. So you had moved fairly swiftly along the tunnel from
23 carriage 6 to carriage 2?

24 A. Yes, a brisk walk, yes.

25 Q. All right. How long after that did you first see

1 a member of the London Underground staff, around that
2 part of the train? You'd obviously exited from the
3 train and you'd been helped there, but at this part of
4 the train?

5 A. I was there several moments looking into the carriage
6 before I saw a member of the London Underground. Two,
7 three minutes had elapsed by me standing at the entrance
8 to the door to actually somebody coming over to me.

9 Q. Did that person bring a ladder?

10 A. Not at the time, no. I had to --

11 Q. Not at the time?

12 A. I had to shout for a ladder.

13 Q. What happened?

14 A. I waited.

15 Q. For how much longer?

16 A. Several minutes again.

17 Q. Did you recognise the staff who were there as including
18 the London Underground staff who had presumably taken
19 you off the back of the train and allowed everyone to
20 exit at the back?

21 A. I honestly can't remember.

22 Q. So a second person, member of staff, appeared after you
23 called out for a ladder?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Did they have a ladder?

1 A. I remember shouting out and my attentions were facing
2 into the carriage, and then every so often I'd look
3 around, because I knew there was movement going on
4 behind me. I didn't know what it was, and so I tried to
5 catch somebody's eye, ie a member of staff from the
6 London Underground. I shouted out several times for
7 a ladder and it did take a little while for a set of
8 wooden steps to appear. When they did appear, they was
9 put in the opposite door -- sorry, not the opposite
10 door, they was put in the door of D6 rather than D8.

11 Q. We can see that you've written the words "entered" there
12 and a cross.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Whilst you were waiting for the ladder and while you
15 were looking in through D8, could you see what
16 Gerardine Quaghebeur was doing?

17 A. She was moving around trying to get round to people.
18 It's -- one thing that's always puzzled us ever since
19 the incident is how she was able to move around the
20 carriage, but with all the debris that was in there, she
21 must have been -- it's always something that's puzzled
22 me, but, yes, she was moving around, seeing to people
23 and, yes, trying to care for them and tend to them.

24 Q. When you climbed on to the floor of the carriage, which
25 way did you go?

1 A. I entered through D6 up the wooden steps that were
2 placed there and I believe I met Gerardine there.

3 Q. Had she moved then, by that stage, towards D6?

4 A. I believe so, but I don't know how she's got from where
5 she was standing where I initially saw her at 16 and 15.

6 I don't know how she got to D6, because, as far as I'm
7 aware, as soon as the ladders were put to D6, I was
8 straight up them.

9 Q. All right. When you boarded the carriage on your left,
10 there were two people seated in what we can see are
11 seats 21 and 22 who certainly, by the time you gave your
12 statement to the police, you knew were Bruce Lait and
13 Crystal Main?

14 A. That's correct.

15 Q. Lying across them, did it seem to you that there was at
16 least one person, perhaps two people as you could look
17 to your left?

18 A. From what I could see, there was one person laying
19 across seats 21 and 22.

20 Q. Which way was she facing?

21 A. Her head was towards D6 and her feet were towards D8.

22 Q. You've marked on the diagram firstly "head" and secondly
23 above the top of the page "female bent around pole".

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. In the debris, was there the handrail that normally --

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. -- that's the end of the perspex screen from the pole to
3 the side of the carriage?

4 A. That's correct. On seat 22 there would normally be
5 a glass or a perspex screen. To the edge of that on the
6 top right-hand corner of seat 22 there is a pole that
7 people use to hold on and to hold in the glass.

8 Q. Did you see a young lady bent around that pole?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Immediately adjacent to the occupant of seat number 22?

11 A. On seat 22.

12 Q. Was it her upper body, her torso, that was on the
13 occupant of seat 22 or her legs?

14 A. It's a bit of both, really, upper torso as she was
15 actually stretched out. Yes, it was her upper torso on
16 22.

17 Q. In your statement, you described how at that stage the
18 lady was semi-conscious and trying to speak.

19 A. That's correct.

20 Q. Do you recall her, Mr Desborough, being able to actually
21 say any words?

22 A. Nothing that was coherent.

23 Q. Was she semi-conscious, because you observed that she
24 was moving or perhaps her eyes were open and, of course,
25 she was making a noise?

1 A. All of that. She was drifting in and out of
2 consciousness while I was with her, all the time that
3 I was with her. Every now and again, like the gentleman
4 before, she would have a -- she would let out a burst of
5 energy, try and grab hold of me, and then I'd just try
6 and calm her down and try and reassure her.

7 Q. Can you tell us, please, something about the description
8 of the young lady? You describe her, I think, in your
9 statement, as young.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. You subsequently told a newspaper, I think
12 The Independent, just a couple of days later, on
13 10 July, that she may have been in her early 20s and she
14 had, you thought, shoulder-length hair. Is that right?

15 A. That's incorrect. I didn't speak to The Independent.

16 Q. You didn't?

17 A. It was The Mirror.

18 Q. Well, it may have been re-reported in The Independent,
19 the press report we have.

20 A. It was reported by a lot of papers at that time.

21 Q. Right. If that was an accurate recollection, can you
22 assist us with what you recall of the length of her hair
23 and the description that you can?

24 A. The length of her hair was down to her shoulders, maybe
25 slightly longer, but not too much, very young, very

1 fresh-looking face, as much as it could have been at the
2 time. I mean, she was blackened, she was sooty, her
3 hair was, again, blackened and sooty. Very tall,
4 I would have thought, I mean, obviously where she's
5 stretched out, slim, yes.

6 Q. The lady doctor who you'd already seen was alongside
7 her, was she not?

8 A. Yes, I believe she was actually attending to the young
9 lady at the time.

10 Q. Was she doing that by holding her upper body, her
11 torso --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- and head to try to help her to breathe and to keep
14 her airway open?

15 A. That's correct, yes.

16 Q. What did you do?

17 A. I climbed into the carriage and the doctor was there.
18 She mentioned to me that the person that was there had
19 lots of internal injuries and that it was going to be
20 tough to keep her going, so she asked me to take over,
21 because obviously it's more important for the doctor to
22 get around the carriage than me, because of her medical
23 knowledge, and I took over and held the young lady in my
24 arms, cradling her as such, with her torso here and her
25 head in my chest, and I'm looking down her body.

1 Q. In your statement, you describe how you tried to get
2 responses from other people in the train by waving at
3 them and shouting --

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. -- and some people responded. Was that because you were
6 calling out for others to help you in your task of
7 comforting and holding the young lady, or for other
8 reasons?

9 A. No, I realised that there was other people. I mean, the
10 young lady that I was holding, we couldn't actually get
11 her free because her foot was trapped, her right foot
12 was caught in the debris in the aisleway between seats
13 22 and 21. The other people that were sitting there as
14 well, they weren't going anywhere because of the debris,
15 they couldn't get up or anything like that. I could see
16 that they were still alive and I realised that I needed
17 to keep them maybe focused on me rather than anything
18 else that was in the carriage. I also realised that
19 I wanted to try to keep them going and get responses
20 from them, because I knew if they started maybe closing
21 their eyes, they might not come back.

22 Q. Mr Desborough, were these steps and your actions
23 conditioned by the first aid course that you had done?
24 You told us that you'd told the doctor that you were
25 a first aider.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Or was that your -- were those your instincts?

3 A. I think it was a bit of both. I mean, as a first aider,
4 I was always told that, if you arrive on a scene, you go
5 to the people that are not making the noise and, trying
6 to assess the situation, it was a number of things,
7 obviously where the steps were put, but also at the time
8 the young lady was making less noise than the actual
9 gentleman in the doorway.

10 Q. You told us that the lady doctor told you that the young
11 lady had lots of internal injuries. Can you be more
12 precise in what you understood then to be the nature of
13 the injuries that she had?

14 The reason I ask is that there was some report later
15 that you may have been aware that she had severe
16 abdominal injuries, or is that not something you knew at
17 the time?

18 A. I believe the doctor said that there was internal
19 abdominal injuries, but I can't -- obviously it's one
20 word. I can't remember precisely. But I know that it
21 was internal injuries at the time.

22 Q. Of course. You spoke to her, no doubt?

23 A. The young lady, yes.

24 Q. Told her to hang in there?

25 A. Hang in there, yes.

1 Q. You comforted her and she opened her eyes occasionally
2 and looked at you?
3 A. That's correct, yes.
4 Q. Meanwhile, you were waiting for help to arrive?
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. Can you help us with how long it was before help did
7 arrive?
8 A. It felt around -- again, I can't give you precise times,
9 but it felt around about twenty minutes.
10 Q. The lady doctor carried on helping other people in the
11 carriage and seeing who was severely injured and who was
12 not. There is some evidence that she shouted out at
13 some stage, "Get me a medic, this woman has only minutes
14 to live if I don't get a medic".
15 Do you recall that being said?
16 A. Yes, I do.
17 Q. When was that said?
18 A. It was when I was holding the young lady in my arms.
19 I'm sorry, I can't give you a precise time, but it was
20 more nearer the time of me entering the carriage than me
21 exiting it, if that makes sense.
22 Q. Yes, it does.
23 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: The victim to whom she was referring,
24 was that the young lady you were cradling?
25 A. Yes, it was.

1 MR KEITH: Who were the first to arrive by way of emergency
2 response?

3 A. I recall the Fire Brigade. There was the chief fire
4 officer there. I remember the two black bands on his
5 helmet when he entered the carriage.

6 Q. How do you know that that indicates a chief or
7 a supervisor?

8 A. At primary school, my primary schoolteacher, her husband
9 was Chief of Fire up in London at the time and we all
10 used to get days out to the fire stations in London
11 where they've got the museum and everything and we done
12 a hell of a lot of project work on firemen and fire
13 brigades at that time and it's just something that stuck
14 in my mind.

15 Q. Where did they appear from, do you recall?

16 A. Yes, two firemen, one of them, the more senior, appeared
17 through the door at D6.

18 Q. How did they get on to the carriage floor?

19 A. They must have used the steps that I used.

20 Q. So you think they were still there?

21 A. Yes. I'm not sure if the steps were actually moved from
22 D6 to D8 and then back and forth during that time, but
23 I only recall one set of steps at any one time.

24 Q. Did they start walking down or around the inside of the
25 carriage?

1 A. The second fireman took over from me holding the young
2 lady. I stood up.

3 Q. Is that because he came straight to you then where you
4 were?

5 A. Yes, the two firemen appeared at the same time in that
6 doorway. I was crouching down at the time and I looked
7 up. The more senior of the fire officers turned round
8 to me and said, "Don't worry, son, he'll look after her
9 now" and we swapped over. I stood up and tried to give
10 an assessment of what I knew what was going on down
11 there to him.

12 He then asked me to go and search the rest of the
13 carriages to see if there was any other survivors, which
14 I did. I started walking from D6 all the way down past
15 D2 into the first carriage. I searched both carriages
16 on the way down.

17 Q. Did you go the other way past what we now know to be the
18 location of the bomb to the rear of the second carriage?

19 A. No, I wasn't able to. There was too much debris in the
20 way.

21 Q. Before you surrendered control of your patient, did you
22 explain to the fire officer what you understood to be
23 the nature of her injuries and what the lady doctor had
24 told you about what they might have been?

25 A. I believe so, yes.

1 Q. Could you see whether or not he was able to give her any
2 medical first aid?

3 A. No, I don't believe he did. Not more than anything more
4 that I could have done, or he could have done. I mean
5 obviously he was trained in that type of thing, but he
6 didn't have or he didn't appear to have any medical
7 equipment with him and, also, as soon as I was asked to
8 go and search the rest of the carriage I did so, so
9 I left them both there.

10 Q. When you came back, was he still there cradling her in
11 his arms?

12 A. Yes, he was.

13 Q. Was the young lady still alive? I think you recall how
14 she was still opening her eyes occasionally --

15 A. She was still alive.

16 Q. -- and making a noise. Can you tell us, please,
17 something about how she was able to do that? Was she
18 moaning or was she shouting?

19 A. She was moaning by this point.

20 Q. In your statement, you then go on to describe how
21 paramedics decided that she should be moved. What
22 I want to ask you about is the arrival of the
23 paramedics.

24 Do you recall how long after the point at which
25 you'd returned to the young lady and the fireman who was

1 holding her before the paramedics arrived?

2 A. It was only several minutes for the time for me to walk
3 along that carriage and across the first and then come
4 back. It wasn't too much time at all. Again, we're
5 talking minutes. It could have been about five minutes.

6 Q. Could you see how many paramedics had arrived?

7 A. From D6, two paramedics arrived where I was. By this
8 time, the wooden stairs had disappeared. One of the
9 paramedics was younger than the other, and he was a bit
10 more sprightly and he was able to jump up into the
11 carriage through D6. The other paramedic, he was
12 a little bit older, not a slim physique, and he tried to
13 jump up and, at this point, myself and the other
14 paramedic had to grab hold of him and -- by the bottom
15 of his coat, and pull him up into the carriage.

16 Q. Did they both come straightaway after that to where the
17 fireman and the young lady and yourself had been?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. They didn't go down the carriage or start to try to
20 triage others, is that where they went straightaway?

21 A. I could see there was movement going on more towards the
22 bombsite, there was people moving around, I believe it
23 was more the Fire Brigade. In fact, when I was speaking
24 to the chief fire officer in the carriage, it caught my
25 attention that another fire officer, or another fire

1 person, had jumped in through D8 and I noticed that the
2 area had been cleared a little bit with regards to what
3 was there, but he come bounding in and I told him to
4 stop exactly where he was because where he was standing
5 is where I saw --

6 Q. The young man in the blue shirt?

7 A. Yes, and also what was behind him as well, more towards
8 where I saw the legs.

9 Q. Right. Did you, yourself, ever go back to -- through D8
10 to where you'd seen the young man with the blue shirt?

11 A. No, I didn't.

12 Q. Or the severed legs?

13 A. No.

14 Q. So continuing with the young lady, there were then two
15 paramedics, yourself and the fireman, the firefighter,
16 the fire officer.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Was it decided that the lady should be moved?

19 A. It was.

20 Q. Were you present when the decision was made to do that?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Was that a decision made by the paramedics or by the
23 fire officer or perhaps by yourself?

24 A. I believe it was the paramedics.

25 Q. There was no stretcher, was there?

1 A. No, there wasn't.

2 Q. And perhaps no room even for a stretcher?

3 A. No.

4 Q. So was a ladder used?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. You, I think, held the young lady's head and neck to

7 help keep her airway open while she was being moved?

8 A. That's correct, yes.

9 Q. Did you all become engaged in the process of trying to

10 lift her from where she was, wrapped as she was around

11 the pole?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Did the paramedics use their equipment to determine

14 whether she was still alive at the point that she was

15 being moved or afterwards?

16 A. They had their bags open before she was moved. I must

17 admit I don't know what they was using, but I can't

18 believe that they would have made the call to move her,

19 if she had already passed away, with the amount of

20 effort that we used to get the young lady from where she

21 was trying to keep her straight. I mean, we was

22 thinking about spinal injuries at the time as well. And

23 then laying her down on the ladder. They wouldn't have

24 made that call if they thought she was dead there and

25 then. There was too many -- it was a lot of effort to

1 have done that, if that makes sense.

2 Q. It does. Could you see whether she was continuing to
3 move and to open her eyes during the process of removing
4 her from around the pole and laying her straight on the
5 ladder?

6 A. By this time, if I remember rightly, she had become
7 quite quiet by now. There wasn't -- yes, there wasn't
8 too much in the way of movement, if any. Yes, she had
9 become very peaceful.

10 Q. I'm sorry to ask you to cast your mind back, but did
11 that moment when she had become more peaceful occur
12 during the process of moving her or before or after?

13 A. I think it was during. The reason being is that all
14 through the time that I was down there because of the
15 period of time there was less and less movement, less
16 and less her trying to call out or move around. So
17 I could physically see her slipping away.

18 To what extent it was -- I mean, granted I'm
19 a medic, but I didn't know how close she was. All
20 I tried to do was -- what I remember from my training,
21 was just hold on in there and, I mean, it's not my call.
22 I would have carried on working and looking after her,
23 even if the medics had turned round and not said
24 anything.

25 Q. Do we take it from what you described, therefore, that

1 no treatment of any kind was applied prior to her being
2 moved? The decision had obviously been taken, you'd
3 done the best you could to console her and to comfort
4 her and to keep talking to her and reassuring her, she
5 had to be moved before medical treatment could be
6 applied?

7 A. Yes, any substantial medical treatment. I don't know if
8 there was anything -- I don't believe anything was done
9 beforehand, but it was all -- yes, it was all a bit of
10 a rush. Time wasn't on our side. So I don't recall any
11 medical treatment being done before the young lady was
12 moved. After taking the time to move her around from
13 the pole and place her on the ladder on the floor of the
14 carriage, a monitor was pulled out of a bag and some
15 things were stuck on her.

16 Q. Electrocardiograph pads?

17 A. Yes, yes.

18 Q. Where was she placed? Where was the stretcher at this
19 stage?

20 A. The stretcher at this stage, or the ladder, this was
21 going across diagonally. The head of the victim was at
22 seat number 10 or to the side of seat number 10, should
23 I say, and it was coming diagonally from right to left
24 downwards, if that makes sense.

25 Q. It does. So one of the paramedics, presumably, applied

1 the pads from the monitoring machine, and was that when
2 you heard the paramedics say "I'm sorry, she's gone"?

3 A. That's correct, yes.

4 Q. Did the paramedics stay there or did they move away?

5 A. I don't know. I mean, we was all huddled around the
6 young lady that was now on the floor, yes, and we was
7 all crouching down, and then I looked up at the medic
8 and he looked at me and he found it hard to tell me that
9 she'd gone. With that, I took a big sigh, stayed there
10 for a bit, and, yes, something must have happened to
11 snap me out of what was going on there, I don't know,
12 something -- yes, I don't know exactly, but I switched
13 my attention then from the young lady, after keeping my
14 head down with her for a few moments, and then turned my
15 attention back towards seats 22 and 21.

16 Q. Because that's where the man and the lady who had
17 originally been pinned into their seats were still
18 there?

19 A. Yes, I later found out that seat 22 was Crystal Main,
20 seat 21 was Bruce --

21 Q. Lait?

22 A. Yes. And all this time, while I was holding this young
23 lady in my arms, who I believed to be Carrie Taylor,
24 I was talking, to keep them going, to keep everyone
25 going, so Carrie knew that there was a voice there, and

1 so I was holding her, trying to reassure her. And
2 obviously, Crystal and Bruce, they were quite stricken
3 with having the young lady across their body -- across
4 their laps and also what they had in front of them.

5 So, again, I tried to take their attention away from
6 what was in front of them and keep them looking at me.

7 Q. Could you see whether there was anybody else in the near
8 vicinity to Crystal Main and Bruce Lait, another person,
9 either partially or fully lying across their bodies?

10 A. Earlier on, when I was looking through D8, I could see
11 beyond the young chap that was in the doorway and
12 I could see things. It wasn't apparent, it was hard to
13 make sense of, and at the time it's hard to put into
14 context, it was -- I recognised things, but obviously
15 these things were in the wrong place and they shouldn't
16 be --

17 Q. Where they were?

18 A. Yes, and so I remember looking at it and I thought "Oh
19 dear, it's turning my stomach", so I averted my eyes and
20 didn't concentrate on that so much because I realised
21 that I had to concentrate on the young man in the
22 doorway and obviously, later on, the other doorway, what
23 was going on there. So I did my uppermost not to look
24 at it myself.

25 Q. May we take it from what you've said, Mr Desborough,

1 that what you saw when you looked to the right through
2 the doorway as opposed to straight ahead where you saw
3 the body of the young man in the blue shirt, was another
4 person, another human being, somewhere on the edge of
5 your --

6 A. Yes, they would have been around between seats --

7 Q. Seats 20 and 21?

8 A. No, they would have been around seats 19 and 14.

9 Q. So you saw some people --

10 A. Yes, when I was standing --

11 Q. -- somebody who appeared to you to be a person somewhere
12 on the floor between 14 and 19?

13 A. Yes, when I was looking in through D8. When I was
14 standing in D6, it was hard to recall, there was so much
15 in the way of debris with regards to metal, and, yes,
16 and other things and, like I was saying, because of what
17 I thought it was, I didn't want to carry on looking at
18 it, I'm sorry.

19 Q. All right. That, however, was in relation to the area
20 between seats 14 and 19.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Did you see at any stage another person draped to
23 a greater or lesser extent upon Bruce Lait and
24 Crystal Main in the vicinity of 20 to 21 and 22 on the
25 same side as the young lady whom you subsequently

1 discovered was Carrie Taylor?

2 A. I personally didn't see anyone. However, Bruce said --
3 I believe he had somebody or something on his feet, and
4 it was one of the reasons why he couldn't move himself
5 apart from the debris in front of him to make him stand
6 up and actually walk out the carriage.

7 Q. So you understood that he was trapped by debris but also
8 by, perhaps, another person?

9 A. That's a possibility, yes.

10 Q. Who took Crystal Main out of her seat? Did somebody
11 have to pull debris away? Was she cut out of the debris
12 or --

13 A. Yes, I believe firemen at the time were pulling out
14 debris from between the seats and they've moved it.
15 I don't know where they moved it to or anything like
16 that. I think by this time, because of what happened to
17 Carrie Taylor, the fire officers asked me to leave, so
18 I stepped down the wooden steps -- so the wooden steps
19 must have appeared from somewhere again -- I stepped
20 down on the wooden steps but actually stood by the doors
21 of D6 again. I wasn't willing to leave because there
22 was still people there that --

23 Q. Needed help?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. I appreciate that you are or were a first aider, but

1 from your unwillingness to leave when it was apparent to
2 you that there were people who still needed help, and
3 the fact that the two paramedics who had come in had
4 gone immediately to Carrie Taylor but there were others
5 who were also severely injured or dying in the carriage,
6 did it seem to you that more help was required in those
7 first few minutes, perhaps ten minutes or so, of the
8 help arriving or did it seem to you that there were
9 enough firemen and paramedics there, given, of course,
10 the constraints and extremely difficult circumstances in
11 which they were operating to do what needed to be done?

12 A. We could have had more people down there.

13 Q. There came a time when Crystal Main, therefore, was able
14 to get out of her seat?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. I think you consoled her, you kept her going by telling
17 jokes about the state of her hair?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And you supported her as she left the carriage by
20 climbing down the ladder, the wooden steps, on to the
21 track?

22 A. Yes, at this point Carrie had been moved, she was on the
23 stretcher, and I stayed down and crouched down with
24 Crystal and, yes, we was talking about the state of her
25 hair, we was both dying to grab a coffee. It was one of

1 my routines to get in the office and I don't actually
2 start work until I've had my first coffee type of thing,
3 I can't get up and going. So just general chitchat like
4 that, like I was saying, to try to keep their attention
5 away from everything else.

6 So now that Carrie had been moved, there was still
7 debris on the floor between the seats, so Crystal wasn't
8 able to leave. So that was cleared and then Crystal and
9 Bruce were able to stand up and leave. I believe Bruce
10 left via D8, but Crystal left via D6. Where they'd
11 started to clear the debris and everything, they started
12 at D8 and I think they slowly worked their way up the
13 carriage, yes.

14 Q. Bruce, though, is the man whom you seem to recollect had
15 said that he was trapped both by debris but also because
16 there was somebody lying on or against his legs?

17 A. Yes, I personally didn't see any --

18 Q. So you didn't see --

19 A. -- a person.

20 Q. -- if there was a person, whether that person was moved
21 away from Bruce Lait allowing him to get out of his
22 seat?

23 A. I didn't see that. There was a lot of commotion going
24 on at the time.

25 Q. Of course.

1 A. It may have been done when I was looking after Carrie,
2 my attentions are on Carrie at the time, yes.

3 Q. Were there still other passengers walking past the
4 train, past the carriage, when you exited with
5 Crystal Main, passengers from other carriages, either
6 the walking wounded or possibly the uninjured?

7 A. I don't believe so. From what I recall -- and I mean
8 you might find out later otherwise -- but I believe
9 I was the last civilian survivor to leave. That's what
10 I tried to make sure of.

11 Q. Did you walk down the tunnel to the Aldgate platform
12 with Crystal Main?

13 A. Yes, I had her in my arms.

14 Q. Carrying her in your arms?

15 A. Arm round her shoulder and --

16 Q. Supporting her?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. You were taken to hospital because you were covered in
19 blood, but not your own, and, therefore, somebody took
20 the decision that you should be seen?

21 A. I don't know if I was covered in blood, but, yes --

22 Q. You had blood on you?

23 A. Yes, I had had better days.

24 Q. As a result of that, I think you were told to get on the
25 bus which was taking victims to hospital?

1 A. Yes, I believe I was put on the second double decker
2 that left Aldgate bus station.

3 Q. You saw, in fact, a number of people on your journey to
4 hospital who had been injured, some severely, and you
5 saw, I think, at the hospital, the same lady doctor,
6 Gerardine Quaghebeur, who had been in carriage number 2
7 with you?

8 A. Yes just by coincidence she was put down, sat down
9 beside me in the waiting area while I was waiting for
10 assessment by any of the doctors. I believe she had
11 a sore wrist at the time. I think her hearing was
12 playing up as well.

13 Q. In your statement, you also describe one other person
14 who was sitting in the seats opposite Crystal Main and
15 Bruce Lait. There was a middle-aged lady, perhaps in
16 her 40s or 50s.

17 A. Yes, sorry, if you could bring up the map again.

18 Q. If we could please have the plan INQ8373, page 2 [INQ8373-1].

19 A. Yes, I believe they would have been sitting maybe in
20 seat 12. The reason why I recognised that woman more
21 than the other two people sitting either side of her is
22 that she looked familiar because she looked like my
23 ex-girlfriend's mother at the time and it was just how
24 she looks, like the same hair and the same age and
25 everything.

1 Q. Was she seated in that seat all the time that you were
2 looking after Carrie Taylor and then subsequently
3 assisting with Crystal Main?

4 A. She was. She did leave at some point but I don't know
5 when. She left before, I believe, Bruce and Crystal,
6 but I wouldn't be able to give you a precise time of
7 when she did, but she wouldn't have been able to move
8 until the debris was cleared from that aisle.

9 Q. So it may be that she would have stayed -- she would
10 have had to have been there until certainly after
11 Bruce Lait and Crystal Main --

12 A. Yes, I believe the Fire Brigade helped her out.

13 Q. To go back to your exit from the carriage, when you
14 walked down the tunnel with Crystal Main, on the
15 assumption you left through D6, which you described as
16 to where you thought Crystal Main left by --

17 A. I believe it was D6.

18 Q. Did you look back through the doors, D8, as you walked
19 past with Crystal?

20 A. No. No, I didn't. By the time I'd left, I realised
21 that the carriage was quite empty. Well, it was empty
22 with surviving people. So I didn't see any reason for
23 me to go back to D8, and as soon as Crystal left D6, she
24 was in a bit of a state and so she come running up to me
25 and gave me a hug as soon as she got off the steps and

1 I hugged her and checked to make sure she was all right,
2 I asked her and everything, yes, and then took her in my
3 arms and we walked up towards Aldgate Tube station.

4 MR KEITH: Mr Desborough, thank you very much. Will you
5 stay there? There may be some further questions for
6 you.

7 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Mr Desborough could you help me
8 before anybody else asks you any questions? When you
9 went off to search the rest of the carriage, what did
10 you see when you went off?

11 A. The windows had been blown out, there was lots of
12 personal artefacts on the floor in the chairs, the odd
13 shoe, book, bag, case, yes, personal artefacts.

14 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: So there was nobody else that you
15 could see that needed your help at that stage?

16 A. Not going towards the front of the train, no.

17 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Yes, does anybody have any questions?
18 Mr Coltart?

19 Questions by MR COLTART

20 MR COLTART: My Lady, thank you. Mr Desborough, I represent
21 the interests of Richard Ellery, who was the young man
22 in the pale blue shirt that you could see when you
23 looked through the doors of D8.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. I just want to ask you, if I may, one or two questions

1 about him. Could we have the plan INQ8373 [INQ8373-1] back up on
2 the screen, please?

3 Now, you've told us that when you first arrived at
4 those doors, D8, that entry level into the Tube carriage
5 was about chest height for you, is that right?

6 A. Yes, that's correct.

7 Q. At that stage, of course, there was no ladder to assist
8 you with entry on to the carriage?

9 A. No.

10 Q. So as far as Mr Ellery was concerned, who was lying
11 there with his back to you -- is that right?

12 A. He kept moving over. I saw him side on, every so often
13 he'd roll over on to his side and I'd try and -- if he
14 rolled on to his side, he would roll facing into the
15 carriage, and so I would try and hold him back so that
16 he was still laying on his back so he didn't look into
17 there, and also it made it easier for me to converse
18 with him, to try to talk with him, to try to keep him
19 calm. If he's rolled over on to his right side, he
20 would have faced into the carriage and, obviously, when
21 somebody's back is to you, it's a bit hard to talk to
22 them.

23 Q. Yes, of course, and how long do you think you were in
24 that position with him, as it were, with you stood
25 outside the carriage and him lying on the floor in front

1 of you?

2 A. Yes, he was probably just as far away as that jug is at
3 the moment.

4 Q. How long do you think the two of you were respectively
5 in that position for?

6 A. Several minutes, maybe about five minutes.

7 Q. You mentioned, when Mr Keith was asking you questions,
8 that if you had been able to get access on to the
9 carriage at that point, and plainly it was impossible,
10 but if you had been able to, you would have administered
11 first aid. What would you have been able to do for him
12 in those circumstances? What would a first aider have
13 done in that situation?

14 A. To be fair, I don't know if there was much that I could
15 have done for him. He was quite burnt down his front.
16 Like I was saying, he'd lost a lot of his clothes and,
17 because it's burns, there's not much I could have done.
18 Don't get me wrong, if I was able to have got in the
19 carriage, I would have obviously checked for vital
20 signs, checked to see his pulse, see how strong it was,
21 I knew that his airway was open because he was making
22 a noise, he was shouting out, so I know that I didn't
23 have to worry about that.

24 I realise that his pulse -- his pulse -- how
25 can I put this? He still had some fight in him and,

1 like I said earlier, when I was trained to do first aid,
2 you were told to go to the people that were not making
3 the noise and, from what I could make out, he was still
4 making noise, he still had fight in him, he was still
5 kicking out and lashing out. But it just so happens
6 that the steps are put in the other doorway.

7 Q. Absolutely, and --

8 A. I wish I could have done more.

9 Q. If it's not plain already, and I hope that it is, there
10 is absolutely no criticism of your decision-making on
11 that day, quite the opposite, and everyone is extremely
12 grateful to you for your efforts.

13 Now, as you say, when the steps arrived, they were
14 placed outside the next set of doors down the carriage
15 outside D6, which is where you then got on.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. From that point onwards, quite properly, you
18 concentrated your efforts on Ms Taylor as you've
19 described to us.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Were you able to see, during the time that you were on
22 the carriage, either then or otherwise, were you able to
23 see or observe Mr Ellery or any change in his condition
24 or his actions?

25 A. I could still hear him lashing out every now and again

1 and, again, I was shouting out to him. It makes it
2 a bit hard to converse with somebody if you don't know
3 their name or anything, so I didn't want it to sound
4 that I was barking orders to somebody, if that makes
5 sense. I was still trying to reassure, and I realised
6 that my tone and what I said could still be heard by
7 other members of the carriage that were trapped there,
8 and, again, I didn't want to cause alarm to them.
9 That's why I did shout out several times to ask him
10 to calm down, but I realised that the more I did that,
11 the more people would be looking towards that end of the
12 carriage where I didn't want them to look.

13 Q. Again, that's easily understood, if I may say so. Did
14 you ever see, at any stage, any of the emergency
15 personnel tending to Mr Ellery or providing him with any
16 treatment?

17 A. The problem that I had was, where I was standing, or
18 crouching, by seat 22, Mr Ellery was laying down beside
19 seat 19 and my vision was obscured a little bit.
20 Because I'm crouching down, I am then at seat level and
21 Mr Ellery would have been below that. Every so often
22 I might have seen his head pop up, I might have seen an
23 arm, I might have seen part of his body but not fully.
24 I realised that, when I was crouching down, there
25 was a lot of movement going on outside the tunnel.

1 I can't tell you exactly who I saw or what I saw, but
2 I know that there was movement going on to try and free
3 up that area where D8 was.

4 Q. When you say there was movement, do you mean there were
5 members of the emergency services in there or that it
6 was --

7 A. It was a mixture of the emergency services and the
8 underground staff.

9 Q. I'm hoping that you might just be able to assist us
10 a little further with timings. Now, this is very
11 difficult, we appreciate, to be precise about it but you
12 mentioned, I think, in your witness statement that
13 shortly after the explosion, when there was some
14 discussion going on in your own carriage about what
15 might have happened, you looked at your phone and saw
16 that the time was 8.51 at that point.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Then you go on to say that, after what seemed like an
19 age, although in reality was probably about ten minutes,
20 you were aware of London Underground staff being in the
21 tunnel outside the train?

22 A. Yes, one of the staff actually come on to the train,
23 through the cab at the end of the train, and he said
24 "We're going to basically escort you off, if you'd like
25 to follow me, please, in an orderly fashion".

1 Because of where I was sitting on the train,
2 I believe I was probably sitting in what would have been
3 seat 22 in carriage 6. I was quite quickly off of the
4 carriage. As we was getting off, the rail staff, they
5 got a -- I faced back into the train to get back down
6 the ladder and the rail staff helped me off by taking my
7 ankles and then putting them on each of the steps
8 because you couldn't see.

9 Q. Because it was dark?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And so, doing the best you can, how long do you think it
12 might have been from the time that you saw the first
13 member of the London Underground staff outside and the
14 time that you were actually let down the stairs out of
15 the train?

16 A. Probably about five minutes, not too much.

17 Q. So by this stage, somewhere around about 9.05 or
18 something of that order perhaps?

19 A. No. If the bomb went off at ten to, I was then most
20 likely leaving the carriage about on the hour.

21 Q. Right, okay, thank you. Then you said quite quickly up
22 the outside of the train to the point at which you
23 reached carriage number 2, which was, as we know, the
24 bomb carriage?

25 A. Mm-hmm.

1 Q. From that moment on until you talk of the first two
2 firemen arriving at the carriage, are you able to assist
3 us roughly with how long that period of time might have
4 been?

5 A. I think it was around 20 minutes.

6 Q. Right.

7 A. 15 to 20 minutes.

8 Q. 15 to 20 minutes?

9 A. I can't be certain, I'm sorry.

10 Q. No, of course.

11 A. I know it's important, but ...

12 Q. No, but we entirely understand that. They arrived on to
13 the carriage. You're asked to conduct the search up to
14 the top of the first carriage and back again, and
15 I think you said that only took a minute or two, is that
16 correct?

17 A. Yes, it didn't take too long. The carriage was empty.

18 Q. Yes.

19 A. So, yes.

20 Q. By the time you got back, that's when more firemen had
21 arrived. Were they already there by that stage with the
22 paramedics?

23 A. Yes, there was more movement going on outside of the
24 actual train by now. There was more bodies moving
25 around. Again, because of the light, where it's being

1 shined into the Tube, it was actually quite dazzling.

2 Q. Yes.

3 A. The smoke had calmed down by now compared to what it was
4 like. So, yes, it wasn't the best conditions to
5 actually try and see things, I must admit.

6 Q. The paramedics had arrived as well by that point, is
7 that right?

8 A. The Fire Brigade turned up first and then shortly after
9 that the paramedics had turned up.

10 MR COLTART: Thank you very much.

11 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Mr Saunders?

12 Questions by MR SAUNDERS

13 MR SAUNDERS: Mr Desborough, there have been some questions
14 already asked of you about the possibility of more than
15 one young lady. One you referred to as Carrie Taylor.

16 A. That's correct, yes.

17 Q. I'm going to ask you some questions, and not very many,
18 about the second young lady we know that was in that
19 sort of position and her name is Fiona Stevenson. Did
20 you know that already?

21 A. Only what I read in the paper, yes.

22 Q. Does your Ladyship have the copy of Mr Desborough's
23 statement?

24 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I do.

25 MR SAUNDERS: Because if it helps your Ladyship, I'm going

1 to be asking questions -- and I don't ask for this to be
2 put up, but it's INQ755-003. So it's page 3 of that
3 statement.

4 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Thank you, I have it.

5 MR SAUNDERS: It's the last paragraph.

6 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Thank you.

7 MR SAUNDERS: All right, Mr Desborough? I just want to
8 remind you -- I appreciate that this statement I think
9 was one that you'd given on 25 September, all right? So
10 it's some -- just over two months after. All right?

11 A. Okay.

12 Q. To give you an idea of when you were talking about this.
13 In the course of this statement, you mention by name
14 both "Bruce", who's obviously Bruce Lait, and "Crystal",
15 Crystal Main?

16 A. Mm-hmm.

17 Q. You describe both of them, and then you say this:
18 "Neither Crystal or Bruce appeared to be able to
19 move because they had at least one body or maybe two
20 lying across them."

21 Tomorrow, her Ladyship is going to hear Mr Lait's
22 evidence and we understand that, in fact, what he will
23 refer to as somebody lying across him is
24 Fiona Stevenson.

25 A. Okay.

1 Q. When you deal with -- obviously the person you had most
2 dealings with was Carrie Taylor?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. If we go back, please, to your marked diagram, you refer
5 there to seeing at the top of the screen, because
6 obviously, at this stage, you didn't know Carrie's
7 name --

8 A. No.

9 Q. "Female bent around pole".

10 A. Mm-hmm.

11 Q. And an arrow pointing down across the carriage towards
12 seat number 22 and you've referred to "head". Do you
13 see where you've written "head" there?

14 A. Yes, I think what we was trying to establish is -- when
15 I spoke to the police then, is that the head -- the way
16 that the person was laying, so the head was towards
17 seat 22 and the legs going out -- yes, going out the
18 opposite way towards D8.

19 Q. Is this the position, Mr Desborough, that those two
20 references -- the "female around the pole" and the
21 "head" -- is the same female?

22 A. Yes, it is.

23 Q. So what you're describing is Carrie, because she is the
24 one you've described to us that you were cradling
25 throughout this period?

1 A. That's correct.

2 Q. And that's the person you were obviously concentrating
3 on?

4 A. Mm-hmm.

5 Q. So you're not, in either of those references, talking to
6 what could be seen as Fiona Stevenson?

7 A. No, it's the one person I'm describing.

8 Q. You've mentioned also Dr Quaghebeur and how she was
9 coming from D8, the doors, and by the time you got in
10 through D6, she happened to be there as well.

11 A. Mm-hmm.

12 Q. When the paramedics come in, do they come in through D6?

13 A. Yes, they did.

14 Q. Have I understood this right: the first person they go
15 to, because she's closest, is Carrie Taylor?

16 A. Where I was, yes. With what was going on and where
17 I was, near seat 22, like I was saying, it made it very
18 hard to see further down the carriage and because I had
19 my head down trying to talk to Carrie.

20 Now, I realise that there was movement going on in
21 the area of D8, but I wouldn't be able to give you full
22 details. When I say "movement" I'm talking about people
23 in and out of the carriage as such.

24 Q. So as far as you're aware, you're waiting for more
25 medical staff to arrive, they do.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And they come to you who are obviously dealing with
3 Carrie?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. So if Mr Lait describes a paramedic coming towards him,
6 he's still in his seat at that stage, isn't he?

7 A. Yes, the paramedic could have come in through D8, but
8 the paramedics that I'm talking about come in through
9 D6. There may have been more paramedics turning up by
10 then.

11 Q. Thank you, you've answered my next question,
12 Mr Desborough, thank you very much for that.

13 Can I then go back to where we were? Your thoughts
14 in September were that Bruce Lait and Crystal Main had
15 one, possibly two, bodies across them?

16 A. They had one body across them. I was told by either
17 Bruce or Crystal that I think they believe they had
18 somebody across their feet, but I personally couldn't
19 see that. There was a lot of debris there and
20 I couldn't get to them because of where I was. There
21 may have been -- I can't clarify the second --

22 Q. I think you've made it very plain for all of us,
23 Mr Desborough, that the focus of your attention was on
24 Carrie.

25 A. It was at the time, and to try to talk to Crystal and

1 Bruce and the other people sitting opposite them, just
2 to try to keep them going.

3 Q. So you're not aware of anybody else who may have still
4 been alive at the early stages when you were in through
5 D6 and obviously dealing principally with Carrie Taylor?

6 A. I must admit, when I first turned up at the doorway of
7 D8 early on, I saw what you've said to me is
8 Richard Ellery. I couldn't see too much movement or
9 I couldn't see any more movement in the area of D8 past
10 Richard, but then again -- yes, I didn't have the best
11 view because I'm here, I've got somebody in front of me
12 here, and then, to actually see past them, it was only
13 every so often when Richard had moved and I could see
14 through his arms or through his legs, but there didn't
15 appear to be any movement past there.

16 Q. Of course, the difficulty you had, you've just described
17 for us, with the step, as it were, we're used to
18 stepping on to the Tube train, comes up to your chest.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. To see in past, looking at the diagram, looking past D8
21 towards 6, of course above your head level is obviously
22 the seats that we see at 19, 20, 21.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. So your view is obviously obstructed in trying to look
25 along towards D6, in any event?

1 A. Yes, like I was saying, I got glimpses of what was past
2 that area. If Richard Ellery had rolled on to his side,
3 on to his right side, he actually then becomes a lot
4 higher and it makes it a bit harder to see over him. It
5 was only when he rolled on to his back I'm able to see
6 a little bit further or a little bit higher over him.
7 That's when I saw the other legs and, just to the right
8 of those -- it's a bit hard to explain what I did see.
9 Q. I'm not going to ask you to recount that to us, but in
10 fact, your view of your vision is across the carriage
11 towards seats 14, 13, 12 and 11 --
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. -- more than down the side?
14 A. Yes, I mean, if I'm standing in D8, all I'm really
15 seeing is what's directly in front of me.
16 Q. Of course.
17 A. I'm not really seeing any of the other -- I might have
18 been able to see 14, but I'm not really going to be able
19 to see -- is that 15 and 12?
20 Q. In fact, I think it goes 13, 12, 11.
21 A. It makes it a bit hard because of the actual angle of
22 where I was.
23 MR SAUNDERS: Mr Desborough, thank you very much indeed.
24 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Ms Sheff?
25 Questions by MS SHEFF

1 MS SHEFF: Thank you, my Lady.
2 Mr Desborough, I represent the interests of
3 Lee Baisden and Benedetta Ciaccia.
4 My learned friend has just been asking you about the
5 scene around Carrie Taylor. I wonder if we could just
6 have the map that you drew back on? Thank you.
7 Benedetta Ciaccia was found between seats 19 and 20
8 and she did not survive the blast. I think we can take
9 it from what you've already said that that was an area
10 which either you were unable to see very well or, if you
11 were, your attention was not focused on that particular
12 area, having your full focus on Carrie Taylor and your
13 attempts to keep her conscious and alive. Is that
14 right?
15 A. That's a fair assumption, yes.
16 Q. You have made reference to seeing various things from
17 which you averted your eyes, and I'm not going to ask
18 you about those in any detail, save to say that those
19 were clearly upsetting things concerning victims and
20 where they were placed.
21 A. Yes.
22 Q. I think you said that, from what Crystal and Bruce told
23 you, you were aware that there was or may have been
24 another body in the vicinity of Fiona Stevenson to which
25 my learned friend has just been referring you, but that

1 wasn't something you saw yourself or you may have been
2 conscious of it out of the corner of your eye but didn't
3 focus on it, would that be fair?

4 A. Yes, I -- yes. I didn't see -- I didn't see anyone else
5 from being in the position at the side of chair 22,
6 seat 22, I didn't see anyone else down that corridor
7 heading towards D8.

8 Q. So visually, you didn't have any view of which it's
9 worthy of you telling us about now, but as far as
10 audibly is concerned, were there any noises or any signs
11 of life at all from that area and, if so, would you have
12 been aware of them?

13 A. I don't believe there was.

14 Q. We know that when you came into the carriage you had
15 already been aware of the doctor, Dr Quaghebeur, who had
16 been in the carriage before you and appeared to be
17 checking for signs of life from other victims, is that
18 right?

19 A. Yes, she was moving around the carriage, it would have
20 been towards the end of the carriage, when I saw her
21 near seats 16 and 15. Like I was saying earlier, where
22 she was moving around, I don't know how she got around
23 the carriage because of the debris, and like I was
24 mentioning, when I went to D6, she was standing there
25 holding Carrie and I don't know how she got from where

1 she was to that area. That's something you'll have to
2 ask the doctor.

3 Q. Indeed, because as far as what you could see of the
4 inside of the carriage there was devastation, there was
5 metal debris, it was very difficult to move from one
6 side of the carriage to the other?

7 A. It was total carnage.

8 Q. Did you see her in the area between the seats 19 and 20
9 at all when you were with Carrie?

10 A. No.

11 Q. She told you that there were two people who died. You
12 said she didn't refer to whom they were, but where was
13 she standing when she told you that?

14 A. It was initially when I first saw her and I believe it
15 would have been 16 and 15, in that area there. She may,
16 thinking about it --

17 Q. Where you've marked on "Female, believed to be
18 a doctor".

19 A. Yes. When she gave me instructions about Carrie, she
20 may have been standing -- I'm just trying to recall
21 properly. She may have been standing in the area --
22 I must admit I don't know, sorry. I'm not too sure
23 where she was when she gave me instructions about
24 Carrie, whether she was standing in, like, the bombed
25 area as such or if she told me when she was crouching

1 down. I must admit I can't remember where that
2 information was given to me.

3 Q. But as far as her referring to people who had died, she
4 wasn't actually tending to anybody at that time, was
5 she, when she told you that?

6 A. No, I don't think so. She called out something. No.

7 Q. So it wasn't obvious to whom she was referring?

8 A. No, no, it wasn't made clear.

9 Q. I also just want to ask you a couple of questions about
10 Lee Baisden. Lee Baisden was found in the area between
11 seats 18 and 19 to the left of your cross, which is
12 where Richard Ellery was found. I don't want to ask you
13 anything which may distress you, but I just wanted to
14 remind you of your evidence about there having been
15 a pair of legs that you saw which appeared to be
16 detached from a body.

17 A. Mm-hmm.

18 Q. Mr Baisden was found without the bottom half of his
19 legs. Was there any other male that you saw in the area
20 between the doors, D8, who appeared to be moving or
21 asking for help?

22 A. There could have been somebody by the seat of 18, but
23 it's unclear. If I remember rightly, I was concerned
24 about Richard Ellery kicking out and then hurting maybe
25 this other person that was there, but because they was

1 facing the opposite way, I believe -- I think so -- it
2 wasn't -- how could I put this -- it wasn't clear that
3 it was a human being laying beside 18.

4 Q. So what you saw in that confusion and devastation was
5 insufficient to give you any clue as to whether that was
6 somebody who needed help or assistance?

7 A. They wasn't moving.

8 Q. They weren't moving?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Did you just say you thought there was somebody who
11 maybe was kicking out?

12 A. Yes, Richard Ellery --

13 Q. Oh, that Richard Ellery was kicking out at. I see.

14 A. -- yes, was head at 19, feet facing towards 18.

15 Q. Yes.

16 A. And I was concerned that he was kicking somebody that
17 was laying the opposite way, head at 18, legs going in
18 towards -- yes, there was definitely somebody there, but
19 it was hard to make out what. Like I was saying,
20 obviously Richard at the time, Richard Ellery at the
21 time was making noise, kicking out and everything, and
22 I just naturally went to him to try to calm him down,
23 because that -- I hate to use it, but because the other
24 pile wasn't moving or making any sign of life,
25 I naturally turned to Richard to try to calm him down.

1 Q. I completely understand, Mr Desborough. So in summary,
2 from what you saw of Richard Ellery's distress, he
3 appeared to be kicking out at somebody or something, but
4 that person or thing was not responding in any way that
5 you could see or react to?

6 A. That's correct, yes.

7 Q. That's very helpful.

8 Just finally this: did you notice, when the
9 paramedics and the Fire Brigade came into your carriage,
10 any of the emergency responders moving any of the bodies
11 in order to gain access to the survivors?

12 A. They must have. I couldn't tell you precisely when,
13 say, Richard was moved or anything like that. The
14 reason why I say that is because the length of time that
15 I spent in the carriage, then seeing that young fireman
16 jump up through D8 and I had to have words with him, if
17 the likes of Richard and the other chap that you
18 mentioned were still there, he wouldn't have been able
19 to have got through the door.

20 So where I had my head down, concentrating on Carrie
21 or speaking to Crystal and Bruce and the other guys,
22 I didn't really give too much attention down to the far
23 end. It was only when I heard Richard scream out that
24 I tried to ask him to keep still, keep calm. But by the
25 time I had left that carriage -- like I was saying,

1 I believe I was the last civilian to leave -- the area
2 was very much cleared.

3 Q. So in fact, in order to gain access through the D8
4 doors, both Mr Baisden and Mr Ellery would have had to
5 have been moved?

6 A. I would say so, yes.

7 MS SHEFF: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Desborough.

8 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Are there any other questions? Yes,
9 Ms Barton?

10 Questions by MS BARTON

11 MS BARTON: Could I have the plan back up, please? Thank
12 you very much.

13 I'd just like you to concentrate, Mr Desborough, if
14 you would, for a moment, on the period during which you
15 were holding Carrie Taylor and waiting for the arrival
16 of London Fire Brigade.

17 During that period, I think we're going to hear that
18 there were two people in particular in the vicinity of
19 seats 15, 16, 17 and 18. So that end of the carriage.
20 First of all, I want to ask you whether at any time
21 you saw a woman leaning through the window of the door
22 at the end of that carriage or were conscious of any
23 female standing up in the vicinity, that vicinity?

24 A. I remember something along those lines.

25 Q. Thank you.

1 A. However, I believe it was the doctor.

2 Q. You believe it was a doctor. Okay.

3 A. If I remember.

4 Q. But you remember somebody standing up in that vicinity?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Thank you.

7 The second issue is, during that same time period,
8 did you at any stage become conscious of a male wearing
9 jeans shouting at the people in those four seats "Stay
10 with us, come on, hold on", words to that effect,
11 something like that?

12 A. Not that I remember. I remember shouting that out
13 myself, but I don't recall anyone else.

14 MS BARTON: Thank you very much.

15 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Any other questions?

16 Mr Taylor, are you sure you want to ask the
17 questions, you don't want to tell Mr Smith? It's
18 entirely a matter for you.

19 MR TAYLOR: No, I'd prefer to ask the questions.

20 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Of course, then, please. All you
21 have to do is press the red button and then you'll be
22 recorded.

23 Questions by MR TAYLOR

24 MR TAYLOR: First of all, I hadn't anticipated asking any
25 questions of Mr Desborough. I don't want to make this

1 any more difficult than it is, but I'm still trying to
2 get my head around the actual response and the medical
3 treatment, if there was any.

4 So, Steven, I'm just trying to find out, do you know
5 what a defibrillation machine is?

6 A. I'm aware of it, yes.

7 Q. Okay. At any time while you were in that carriage, did
8 you see a defibrillation machine deployed?

9 A. I don't remember seeing one. I don't remember one --
10 I know one wasn't used, but I -- if it was a piece of
11 medical equipment that was in there, because there was
12 bags chucked in by the paramedics, it may have been
13 there, but I never actually saw a defib being used at
14 all.

15 Q. At any time when you was in the carriage, did you see
16 any CPR given?

17 A. No.

18 Q. When you said -- I believe that it was already asked --
19 when you said that maybe Carrie's vital signs were
20 checked by the paramedics, do you remember how they
21 checked the vital signs?

22 A. No, not precisely, no.

23 MR TAYLOR: Okay, thank you.

24 MS SIMCOCK: My Lady, I wonder if I could ask one question
25 arising out of that, I represent the London Ambulance

1 Service?

2 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Yes, of course.

3 MS SIMCOCK: I'm very grateful.

4 Questions by MS SIMCOCK

5 MS SIMCOCK: Mr Desborough, you, earlier on, gave evidence
6 about electropads being put on Carrie Taylor's chest.

7 Do you remember that?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. You said that there was a monitor attached. Did you see
10 what was on the monitor?

11 A. No, sorry.

12 Q. And it's after that happened that a paramedic says "I'm
13 sorry, she's gone", is that right?

14 A. Yes.

15 MS SIMCOCK: I'm very grateful. Thank you, my Lady.

16 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Mr Desborough, unless Mr Keith has
17 any questions, that looks as if it's all the questions
18 we have for you. I think we all appreciate you could
19 have kept on walking, Mr Desborough, instead of which
20 you chose to go into that carriage and that appalling
21 scene.

22 There are a number of people who owe you a debt of
23 gratitude and I'm sure that Mr and Mrs Ellery, Mr and
24 Mrs Taylor and others, including the survivors that you
25 helped, are deeply appreciative of the fact that you

1 stopped to try to help and that you were there with
2 their loved ones. Thank you very much.

3 A. Thank you.

4 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Yes, Mr Keith? Did you want to have
5 a break or are we continuing?

6 MR KEITH: We have one witness waiting and then there is an
7 application before my Lady provisionally listed for
8 about 4.30. I think a short break could possibly
9 accommodate both still. I appreciate this is harrowing
10 and difficult evidence.

11 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: This is another survivor?

12 MR KEITH: He is.

13 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I don't want to keep another survivor
14 waiting. I think we ought to get on.

15 MR KEITH: Indeed.

16 Mr Bonwick will be called by Mr Hay.

17 MR GUY BONWICK (sworn)

18 Questions by MR HAY

19 MR HAY: Good afternoon, you're Mr Guy Bonwick?

20 A. That's right, yes.

21 Q. You provided two statements to the police, the first
22 dated 7 July 2005 and the second dated 13 July 2005?

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. I obviously want to ask you some questions about 7 July,
25 and on that day, you left from Welwyn Garden City in the

1 morning?

2 A. That's correct, yes.

3 Q. You travelled to King's Cross where you boarded the
4 Circle Line train, intending to go to Tower Hill?

5 A. That's correct.

6 Q. In your witness statement, you say you got on to the
7 third or fourth carriage, but I think we now know that
8 it was the second carriage?

9 A. I've actually been back since and where I've said the
10 direction of the train was going, it was actually the
11 other way, so that sort of answers a few questions,
12 I think, if you look at my diagrams.

13 Q. That brings me on to exactly where I was going to go, to
14 where you were located in the carriage. Perhaps if we
15 start with one of the plans I believe you drew.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. INQ8366 [INQ8366-1].

18 It's a little bit faint, maybe it's pencil, but on
19 the left we can make out there it says "carriage
20 direction"?

21 A. Yes, I think actually the direction is going the
22 opposite way, so I would have got on -- because where
23 I've written "double doors", that's where I got on at
24 King's Cross and I believe the wall, when the train was
25 in the tunnel, was on the far -- the upper side of the

1 diagram.

2 Q. Where it says "single door", is that the door closest to
3 the front of the carriage or to the rear of the
4 carriage?

5 A. To the rear of the carriage, I believe in the diagram
6 before that was D8.

7 Q. Where you've put "double doors", is that the next set of
8 doors along?

9 A. Yes, that's correct.

10 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I'm sorry to interrupt you, Mr Hay.

11 I wonder if Mr Smith would just come close for a second.

12 (Pause).

13 I'm sorry about that, Mr Bonwick, I am just making
14 arrangements that the argument to which Mr Keith
15 referred, I think that after this evidence is complete
16 we ought to break and I will deal with that matter
17 tomorrow morning, first thing.

18 MR KEITH: My Lady, yes.

19 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Sorry about that.

20 A. That's okay.

21 MR HAY: We just established that the single door is at the
22 rear of the carriage and the double doors are the next
23 one along, which we now believe is D6.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Initially, you got into the carriage and you were

1 standing?

2 A. I was, yes, the train was very full when I got on at
3 King's Cross, everyone was in the seats.

4 Q. But a seat eventually became available at
5 Liverpool Street. Is that correct?

6 A. That's correct, yes.

7 Q. If we could go to INQ10280, and then page 7 [INQ10280-7], please.
8 Just so that you have your bearings, if we could
9 zoom in at the bottom part of the diagram, please, the
10 left-hand side is the rear of the carriage.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. The right-hand side is the front of the carriage. The
13 "X" denotes where the bomb was detonated.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You now, as I understand, got on at D6?

16 A. I got on at D6 at King's Cross, yes.

17 Q. You went towards the middle of the carriage in the bank
18 of seats between 10 and 23, is that correct?

19 A. That's correct, yes.

20 Q. Where do you say that you went and sat?

21 A. I believe I sat on seat 24 and then moved across to 23
22 because there was a paper in the bit to the left of 23
23 which I picked up and began to read.

24 Q. If we could just move on to page 8, please [INQ10280-8], in this
25 diagram, you're actually marked as number 24, but

1 actually you were sitting now in the seat opposite that?

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. You were reading the Metro when the bomb was detonated,
4 is that right?

5 A. Yes, that's correct.

6 Q. What do you actually recall of the explosion itself?

7 A. I don't honestly recall an awful lot. Having read both
8 the statements, I think in my first one, which was done
9 on 7 July, literally at the Royal London Hospital,
10 I said I heard a bang, and then, in the other one,
11 I said I didn't hear anything.

12 To be honest with you, all I remember is it going
13 pitch black and then sort of waiting for a period of
14 time before, I suppose, I came round. I felt like I was
15 floating as soon as -- after the bomb had gone off.
16 That's the only way I could describe it, really.

17 Q. After that, were you still in your seat, or were you on
18 the floor or --

19 A. I was still in my seat. My left leg was trapped. When
20 I came round, or when -- from the next moment
21 I remember, I can describe it as people have said it's
22 like a film, I remember seeing an episode of Casualty
23 once and they did a train crash on there and that's
24 exactly what I thought, that's what I thought had
25 happened, I thought the train had crashed and it was

1 just carnage.

2 Q. I think you mentioned it was dark and the carriage began
3 to fill with smoke.

4 A. It was, yes.

5 Q. That obviously not only made it difficult to see, but
6 I think also made it difficult for you to breathe.

7 A. Yes, that was correct. I remember trying to hold my
8 breath because it felt like you shouldn't be breathing
9 at that point, and then -- that's all I remember,
10 really.

11 Q. Then did the smoke begin to clear?

12 A. Yes, the next thing I remember is the smoke clearing
13 slightly and I looked to my -- forwards to the left
14 towards double doors, D5, and I realised that they had
15 been -- they weren't there anymore, and I remember
16 trying to free my leg up, and then I believe I was the
17 first person off the train because I walked towards D5
18 and jumped down, but not realising how steep it was
19 between when -- how high the train was off the ground,
20 and I remember nearly breaking my ankle or hurting my
21 ankle, it sort of jarred it a little bit, but I was
22 lucky there, and then I walked right towards D3. I'm
23 not sure how far up the carriage I went, but I remember
24 people sort of knocking on the windows and just saying,
25 you know, "What's happened? What do we do?"

1 Q. Just pausing there, when you got out from D5, do you
2 remember the tunnel wall being very close to you at that
3 point?

4 A. Yes, I think I put my hand on the tunnel wall to sort of
5 steady myself as I jumped down.

6 Q. You say you managed to walk along between D5 towards D3.
7 Was there sufficient space between the tunnel wall and
8 the side of the train for you to move readily?

9 A. Yes, I believe so.

10 Q. You said that people were banging on the windows?

11 A. They were sort of -- yes, as I recall, they were banging
12 on the windows and asking me what had happened or just
13 sort of looking for an explanation, really, I suppose,
14 and I told them to come back down towards D5, I believe,
15 and I waited there, and I remember a man jumping down
16 and he helped me to help some of the other passengers
17 off.

18 Q. I think you helped a number of people off the train at
19 that point?

20 A. I did, and I think they started to walk up towards
21 Liverpool Street direction, because I remember them
22 coming back again, realising that it was -- they were
23 going the wrong way and Aldgate was the best way to get
24 out.

25 Q. Are you able to give an indication of how many people

1 you helped off the train?

2 A. I was thinking about this. I can't really remember,
3 maybe between six and eight, I suppose, something like
4 that maybe.

5 Q. At that point, rather than walking towards Aldgate
6 yourself, you actually got back on to the train?

7 A. I got back on because I wanted to see if there was
8 anyone else I could help. I didn't really know what had
9 gone on at this point, but the doors, I think, had maybe
10 blown and hit the wall and come back in, because
11 I remember it being flat and I was able to get up on the
12 door and try and get back in.

13 Q. Did you come back in through door D5 --

14 A. I believe so, yes.

15 Q. -- where door D5 would have been? We've heard already
16 that obviously, when you walk on to a Tube, you walked
17 on to the ground level, but it's effectively chest
18 height. How easy was it for you to get back up into the
19 carriage?

20 A. I don't believe it was easy, but I think, because the
21 door was quite flat, I was able to put my hands up and
22 jump up or push myself up on to the door and get back
23 in.

24 Q. When you came back into the carriage, did you then move
25 towards your right towards where the bomb had been

1 detonated or towards the left?

2 A. I did, yes, walked to my right.

3 Q. If we could go to INQ8367 [INQ8367-1], please, again it's a little
4 bit faint, but I think it's a diagram which you drew.
5 There appear to be some arrows in the centre of the page
6 which appear to be showing a path which maybe you took,
7 is that correct?

8 A. Yes, that's correct.

9 Q. On the far left in the left-hand corner it appears to
10 say "Young lad in suit"?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Did you make your way from D5 across towards the young
13 man in the suit?

14 A. I did. First of all, there was -- there were two --
15 I think there were two ladies sat there and they had --
16 the window frame had been blown out and was on top of
17 them or on their legs, I can't recall exactly, but
18 I think I picked that up and threw it outside of the
19 train. I can't remember which doors I threw it out of.
20 I would imagine it would be D5, but I couldn't tell you
21 for certain.

22 And I tried to get them to get up, but for some
23 reason they couldn't get up. I would imagine it's
24 probably the debris round their legs.

25 And then I believe I carried on further on into the

1 carriage and seeing the lad.

2 Q. We heard earlier from Mr Desborough, who was a little
3 bit perplexed about how Dr Quaghebeur had managed to
4 make her way from one side of the carriage to the other.
5 You would have had to have been going in the opposite
6 direction, how easy was it for to you make your way
7 across there?

8 A. I don't remember, but for some reason it was do-able.
9 I suppose there was a lot of carnage on the floor, but
10 I can't tell you how I did it, but it was what happened.

11 Q. When you say there was lots of carnage on the floor,
12 I don't want to distress you, but was it rubble or
13 debris or --

14 A. I think there was a lot of twisted metal. I don't
15 remember -- it was so dark, it was difficult to see
16 anything at all, and I'm quite grateful for that,
17 hearing some of the other people talk.

18 Q. Eventually, you made your way to the young man in the
19 suit, who we believe is Richard Ellery, and you describe
20 him as being 18 to 20 years' old in your statement. You
21 mentioned he was wearing a suit. Can you describe any
22 of the other clothes which this person was wearing?

23 A. I don't remember fully, other than it was -- I remember
24 it being very dark. I think perhaps it was sort of torn
25 in places, but I just remember him rocking back and

1 forward and I tried to sort of snap him out of it and
2 say "Are you all right?" but I just couldn't get through
3 to him.

4 Q. You said he was rocking backwards and forwards.

5 A. I believe so, yes.

6 Q. Was he lying on the floor, was he sitting up or in the
7 foetal position?

8 A. I believe he was sort of sitting with his hands on his
9 knees or on his head, I can't tell you for certain, it's
10 difficult to remember. You think you're acting
11 normally, but you're probably in shock. And he was just
12 sort of -- I just remember him rocking back and forwards
13 and anything I said to him he -- I couldn't get through
14 to him.

15 Q. You say you couldn't get through to him. Did he respond
16 in any way to anything that you said to him?

17 A. I remember him responding in that he was definitely
18 making a noise. I just asked him whether he was all
19 right, but I couldn't tell you whether he responded
20 coherently or not, to be honest with you. I don't fully
21 remember.

22 Q. At this point, he was obviously still plainly alive.
23 Were you able to get a feel for his breathing, whether
24 or not it was fast or shallow?

25 A. I thought he was all right, to be honest with you.

1 I thought, you know, he was just in shock and I couldn't
2 really see exactly what was wrong with him. I just
3 could see him sort of in shock and rocking back and
4 forward, really.

5 Q. At that point again, I know it's difficult, but how long
6 had passed since the explosion?

7 A. I don't think it was long, because I remember getting up
8 immediately from when the explosion happened, perhaps
9 30 seconds to a minute later or two minutes max,
10 I suppose, and getting down, and then helping the people
11 off couldn't have taken more than three or four minutes,
12 so I would imagine I had been up, I don't know, maybe
13 seven minutes, something like that, ten minutes maybe.

14 Q. Were you able to see anything next to this young man?
15 We had a description earlier from Mr Desborough. Is
16 there anything that you saw in that area?

17 A. My memory seems to block out the left side of anything
18 that was down that side and, further on, I can't recall
19 anything else other than the lad, I'm afraid.

20 Q. At that point, I think you realised there was nothing
21 more that you personally could do?

22 A. Yes, I don't have any first aid training and I think
23 I was -- I was probably causing more harm than good
24 being there, and I thought it would be better off trying
25 to go out and get some help, I suppose.

1 Q. What you say in your statement, you say:

2 "I then decided to go and get help."

3 Do I take it from that that, at that point, there
4 was no one from either London Underground or from the
5 emergency services in the carriage?

6 A. No, not that I saw, definitely not. I did see on my way
7 out there was a guy walking towards us, I believe from
8 London Underground. I think he had long hair, if
9 I recall correctly, and perhaps a torch. That was a bit
10 later on when I was helping the lady out from the
11 carriage as well.

12 Q. What made you think he was from London Underground?

13 A. I remember seeing his London Underground outfit.

14 Q. I think you exited the carriage at that point and you
15 helped a couple of other people down as well?

16 A. Yes, there were two ladies sat, I believe, on doors D6
17 and they couldn't get down because it was too high and
18 one of them was severely injured, she had a head injury,
19 a lady called Cynthia, I believe I've met subsequently.

20 So I helped her down and the other lady and then
21 walked her along the track. She was sort of leaning
22 against me because she was struggling to walk.

23 Q. In your statement, you say, when you were walking along
24 the track, you were directed by the Fire Service and
25 station staff to sit on the floor just outside the

1 station?

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. When did you first see the Fire Service? Were they in
4 the tunnel, on the platform?

5 A. I believe they were just inside the station concourse.

6 I remember going through the gate at the bottom of the
7 platform, sort of up from the track and through the gate
8 at the bottom of the platform and then up the stairs.

9 It may have been on the stairs or just by the ticket
10 barriers.

11 Q. Could we bring up INQ10280 and then page 3 [INQ10280-3], please?

12 This is a diagram, a three-dimensional diagram of
13 Aldgate station. Are you able to say there where you
14 saw the Fire Brigade? You can see the ticket office at
15 the top and then there are some stairs down to the
16 mezzanine level.

17 A. Yes, I think someone may have helped us up the stairs
18 just here by -- above number 2, but there was definitely
19 more people in the ticket concourse -- at the ticket
20 office there up the top.

21 Q. The members of the Fire Brigade, are you able to say
22 what they were doing? Did they appear to be getting
23 their kit out or --

24 A. Immediately when we came out, there was a couple came to
25 help us, I believe, and we sat just -- straight out the

1 ticket office and on the left by the wall and I believe
2 they gave us some of the silver jackets to keep us warm
3 and I was just sat with Cynthia then, just talking to
4 her because she was going in and out of consciousness.

5 Q. Again, I know it's difficult, but are you able to say
6 how much time had passed until you managed to get to the
7 ticket office?

8 A. Perhaps 10, 15 minutes. I don't remember there being
9 many people from the carriage out there or from the
10 train out there when I was there, and I remember it sort
11 of gradually getting busier as time went on, but I'd
12 say, yes, maybe 15 minutes, 10 minutes.

13 MR HAY: Mr Bonwick, I have no more questions for you, but
14 there may be some more.

15 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Mr Coltart?

16 Questions by MR COLTART

17 MR COLTART: Only one or two. Just in relation to your
18 dealings with Richard Ellery, the young lad in the suit
19 at the end of the carriage there, you said that you
20 spoke to him and asked him if he was all right and that
21 he was incoherent in his response.

22 A. I can't remember whether he was coherent or incoherent.
23 I can't recall, I'm afraid.

24 Q. Are you able to recall now -- and if you can't, please
25 say so -- but are you able to recall whether he appeared

1 to be responding to your questions --

2 A. Yes, I would -- I think he was responding to me.

3 I can't tell you whether or not he said anything back to

4 me, but I definitely asked him if he was all right and

5 he definitely responded.

6 MR COLTART: Thank you.

7 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Are there any more questions for

8 Mr Bonwick?

9 MR SAUNDERS: No thank you.

10 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Mr Taylor, no questions?

11 MR TAYLOR: No.

12 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Right, that looks as if it's all the

13 questions for you, then, Mr Bonwick. Obviously, you,

14 too, could have just walked away and made your escape.

15 In fact, you got off the carriage, but you went back in.

16 So thank you for everything that you did.

17 A. I'm sorry I couldn't have done more, to be honest with

18 you.

19 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: There are many people who are very

20 grateful to you. I don't know if you were here when

21 I spoke to Mr Henning and I didn't say it to

22 Mr Desborough, but to any of you who survived that day,

23 if there are any matters that you think I should be

24 pursuing or any questions that you think I should be

25 asking, please don't hesitate to let Mr Smith know and

1 I will consider whether or not there are any relevant
2 matters there that I should be pursuing. All right? So
3 don't think on the way home "Oh, I wish I had said
4 that".

5 Thank you very much. It looks as if we didn't
6 manage to stop Mr Vassell-Adams arriving, Mr Keith.

7 MR KEITH: It would seem not, my Lady.

8 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I'm just wondering if what I said
9 earlier would have led to anybody else who might have
10 been interested in this argument disappearing.

11 MR KEITH: Well, I see Mr Hill is here who has submissions
12 to make in relation to the CCTV.

13 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I had submissions from the legal
14 editor of the Press Association.

15 MR KEITH: Yes. It may be, I don't know whether or not the
16 author of those submissions, Mr Dodd, is here, but it
17 may be that there is --

18 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Oh, he is here? Well, he hasn't gone
19 as a result of my suggesting I would hear it tomorrow,
20 so we have both Mr Dodd and Mr Vassell-Adams.

21 MR KEITH: I apologise on all their behalves for our
22 disobedience.

23 The argument in relation to text messages may be
24 a fairly short one. The CCTV evidence point may be
25 a little longer because the submissions have been

1 developed in due course and are supported by the
2 evidence from a detective chief inspector sworn upon
3 whom Mr Hill relies, and I don't know whether you've
4 received a copy of that statement yet.

5 But if it pleases my Ladyship, we could deal with
6 the text messages fairly swiftly and then my Lady could
7 assess whether or not the argument in relation to CCTV
8 is one that needs to be developed at greater length.

9 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Right, Mr Vassell-Adams, in which
10 case we can embark upon it tonight. We'll have to see
11 how far we get, as I'm sure you and Mr Dodd will
12 appreciate it has been a very long and difficult day for
13 many people in court, so I'm not going to sit late.

14 MR KEITH: My Lady, I've just received a copy of some
15 further submissions from Mr Vassell-Adams dated
16 18 October in relation to the text messages. I don't
17 know whether my Lady has seen that?

18 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Well, as you say, Mr Keith, it may be
19 that we can short-circuit the argument.

20 MR KEITH: Yes, may I set out the position in relation to
21 text messages as briefly as I'm able?

22 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Certainly, as long as you make clear
23 that on the last occasion you had had very limited
24 notice of the text messages. I think it needs to be
25 made plain that your response at the time was when you'd

1 had very little chance to actually assess the messages
2 yourself.

3 MR SAUNDERS: My Lady, forgive me for interrupting, but
4 I know on the last occasion Ms Gallagher did address you
5 on this matter.

6 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: She did and she wants -- I've had
7 submissions from her, I know what she's going to say,
8 but I'm grateful, Mr Saunders, for your raising it.

9 MR COLTART: My Lady, forgive me for rising as well, but can
10 I say that my clients are neutral on all of these
11 arguments. My time might be more constructively spent
12 in conference with my instructing solicitor, whom I need
13 to see this afternoon if I can.

14 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Of course. Anybody else who needs to
15 leave, I'll understand. Essentially, the argument on
16 the text messages is whether or not the other text
17 messages used or sent on the operational phones by some
18 or all of the four men which appeared on the screen when
19 Mr Keith referred to one of the text messages should be
20 published on the website and should be adduced in
21 evidence.

22 For those who don't know, Ms Gallagher sent in
23 submissions saying that she has considered those text
24 messages now and she intends to argue that they are
25 relevant and should be adduced in evidence.

1 So Mr Keith has now had an opportunity to consider
2 the text messages with rather greater time for
3 reflection and I think your stance may have changed,
4 Mr Keith.

5 Submissions re publication of EPE documents shown in court

6 MR KEITH: Thank you, my Lady, yes.

7 Plainly last week I read out only those two text
8 messages, namely, the two text messages to and from
9 Lindsay's phone, but did not read out, although they
10 appeared on the Lextranet screen, the remainder of the
11 two relevant pages.

12 I referred my Lady to the case of Waterfield to
13 which all my learned friends have made reference in
14 their own submissions, but it was the case that
15 I brought to my Lady's attention a few weeks ago and
16 my Lady ordered that no publication be made of those
17 text messages to preserve the position whilst my Lady
18 could hear further arguments.

19 It seemed to me, and it still does seem to me, that
20 there is at least an argument that, if there is material
21 to which reference is made by its appearance on an EPE
22 device but to which no reference is made in open court
23 because it is not relevant, that that material may not
24 necessarily be published and that may not, therefore,
25 necessarily be the subject of an order that such

1 material be republished by way of further dissemination
2 and provision of the hard document or exhibit, whatever
3 it is, to the press.

4 But, of course, if that material were to be
5 relevant, then of course the position is completely
6 different, because commensurate with the principle of
7 open justice, the press may report anything to which
8 reference is made in open court.

9 My position was that I did not consider at the time
10 it was relevant, but certainly my learned friend
11 Ms Gallagher, and I know my Lady, are of the view that
12 it is relevant and certainly there is a very good
13 argument that it is relevant to the state of mind of the
14 four bombers, and in the very persuasive and, if I may
15 say so, very well-prepared and attractive submissions
16 advanced by Mr Dodd he says in relation to relevancy:
17 "The material gives an intriguing insight into the
18 state of mind of the bombers as they approached the
19 final stages of their murderous missions. They give
20 some idea of the men's psychologies, motivations, mood
21 and relationships on the eve of the attack. The
22 information is of the public interest in which the
23 public has a right to know."

24 My Lady, if the material is relevant, and my Lady
25 rules it to be so, then there could be in principle or

1 in practice no objection to publication of the rest of
2 the text messages on that page, those text messages
3 having appeared on the screen.

4 We can make available copies of it if my learned
5 friends and the members of the press wish it.

6 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I think I need to be reminded.
7 I asked for a copy.

8 MR KEITH: My Lady, I have a copy here.

9 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Whilst we're searching for this,
10 Mr Tibber, I appreciate you don't have Ms Gallagher with
11 you, but I think I have summarised the position that you
12 take on behalf of your lay clients now, which is that
13 you would, at some convenient moment, like to adduce in
14 evidence the text messages to which Ms Gallagher makes
15 reference in her submissions?

16 MR TIBBER: My Lady, I think that is likely. Ms Gallagher
17 was intending to be here, I think, at 4.30, which is --

18 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Is she? I'm sorry, I didn't mean to
19 preempt her.

20 MR TIBBER: It sounds like she would be pushing at an open
21 door anyway, so ...

22 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Thank you very much.

23 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: My Lady, I believe there were a number of
24 members of the press down at the bottom of the stairs,
25 because they all told me I wasn't going to get to speak

1 today, and I suspect that they may be interested in
2 hearing -- certainly some of them are from organisations
3 I represent, so I'm slightly unfortunate --

4 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Right.

5 A MEMBER OF THE PRESS: I am here on behalf of (inaudible).

6 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: In which case I think we'd better
7 pause. I really don't want to -- I'm sorry about this,
8 Mr Vassell-Adams. Because we'd had such a long day and
9 because I thought the last witness was going to take
10 much longer, I took a decision that I would deal with
11 this matter tomorrow morning, so what I'm concerned
12 about is that somebody who's interested might have left.

13 The lady at the back --

14 A MEMBER OF THE PRESS: I understand the BBC, Sky News. For
15 ITN the lady is downstairs, I could run and get her.

16 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: If we had at least those organisations
17 who have been very closely engaged on this issue, at
18 least if we're dealing with -- I understand no decision
19 has been made at the moment as to whether the CCTV or
20 the video footage will be dealt with, but on the text
21 issue, it is a relatively short point, and I think,
22 I hope, your Ladyship has some very short written
23 submissions that I sent to the court earlier today.
24 They are sixteen paragraphs and, essentially,
25 I don't disagree with a single word that Mr Dodd says

1 and his submissions make very good sense indeed, but
2 I would structure it slightly differently.

3 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Sorry, just before we go on, could
4 I have please either up on the screen or a copy of the
5 text messages?

6 MR KEITH: My Lady, the first one is 10516, page 47 [INQ10516-47].

7 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I have them now, thank you.

8 MR KEITH: Those are the text messages from Lindsay to Khan.
9 The relevant one initially at any rate was the
10 penultimate one on the page which was a response to an
11 earlier one from Khan to Lindsay. Perhaps if we take
12 a moment to see what they consist of, if you could
13 scroll back up the page, please, so we can see all of
14 them, down again a bit --

15 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: On the last occasion, just so that
16 I understand the position, the whole of this page
17 appeared on the screen, including text messages going
18 back to 29 June?

19 MR KEITH: My Lady, yes.

20 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Because they are all text messages,
21 as Mr Dodd points out, which are sent on operational
22 phones?

23 MR KEITH: They are, that's quite correct. Those are just
24 the way in which the phones -- the phone belonging to
25 Lindsay was analysed, those are the messages which his

1 phone shows as having been sent to Khan.
2 A different exhibit, INQ10485, page 6 [INQ10485-6], show from the
3 same phone text messages received by Lindsay from Khan.
4 The one that was read out was the third one on the page
5 at 04.35.30. The rest of the page appeared on the
6 screen.
7 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Right, now we've lost most
8 representatives of the families. I assume they've had
9 an opportunity to consider their position. They seem to
10 be neutral.
11 MR KEITH: My Lady, yes. As you've just heard my learned
12 friend Mr Vassell-Adams say, his submissions accord with
13 those from Mr Dodd on behalf of the Press Association.
14 The reason that I had raised the matter before
15 my Ladyship in the way that I did last week is that,
16 although there is a strong argument that material is
17 relevant, and you have the submissions from Mr Tibber on
18 that, and the submissions from the Press Association,
19 and, therefore, if you rule it to be relevant, then the
20 question of publication falls away, but there is a wider
21 issue and it may be worth, if I may, just taking
22 a moment to deal with that wider issue because this
23 problem may arise again in the future.
24 Plainly, there will be times when we will be
25 referring to evidence that appears on the screen but

1 which may not find its way into the court record on the
2 basis that it is not relevant to the particular area
3 which is under discussion.

4 The law and practice have moved on since the time of
5 Waterfield, a point made by the Press Association, and
6 plainly, when the time -- when the Court of Appeal made
7 the decision that it did in that case that there was no
8 such thing as electronic presentation of evidence, and,
9 therefore, there was no practical means by which members
10 of the press would see an exhibit or a document unless
11 reference were made in open court to that document or
12 exhibit and one presumes that a reference would only be
13 made in open court if the particular extract were
14 relevant.

15 But, as I say, things have moved on now and it does
16 present or would present very real practical
17 difficulties during the course of these proceedings if,
18 having made a reference to a document, one had to redact
19 from that document anything to which reference had not
20 been made in open court, because the document, that part
21 of the document, to which reference had been made would,
22 in accordance with your general direction, be made
23 available to the press, but it would be extremely
24 difficult and time-consuming to redact the rest of it.
25 Therefore, may I, because it seems to me that your

1 general direction provides a way forward, invite you to
2 rule that, in future, where reference is made to a page
3 by way of the appearance of that page on the screen the
4 whole of that page is deemed to be relevant and
5 admissible and disclosable and, therefore, may be
6 published by the press and in accordance with your usual
7 direction where express reference is made to a document
8 that that document may then appear on the public
9 website.

10 All that, of course, is subject to the second part
11 of your general direction, my Lady, which is that, if
12 there are specific objections or specific concerns which
13 have been raised, then of course an opportunity will be
14 afforded to those who raise them to argue before you
15 that the general rule should be disapplied.

16 As I say, there are perhaps principle arguments as
17 to whether or not material to which no reference is made
18 in open court is in fact relevant and, therefore, could
19 therefore be the subject of publication. There are
20 authorities dealing with the extent of the common law
21 and article 10 obligations, but it's plain that they
22 make reference to material which is adduced in
23 proceedings. As I said, there is certainly an argument
24 that if no one mentions a document and its only
25 appearance is that fleetingly on a screen, it has not in

1 fact played any part in the proceedings. But for my
2 part, I don't wish to pursue that principled argument.
3 I would be content with the order that I have outlined
4 subject to my Lady's approval.

5 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Well, Mr Vassell-Adams, it sounds as
6 if Mr Keith is offering you, if I agree, a pragmatic
7 solution to the question of the texts, which is
8 essentially, without accepting there is any right to
9 have documents placed on the screen on the public
10 website or these text messages placed on the public
11 website, that for pragmatic reasons, if a page appears
12 on the screen, essentially the document is deemed -- or
13 that page is deemed relevant and admissible.

14 Do you have any objection, if I was prepared to go
15 down that path, to my taking a pragmatic approach, or
16 are you desperately seeking a ruling on the principle,
17 given that we're coming to a different principle when it
18 comes to the video footage?

19 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: I'm not desperately seeking a ruling on
20 the principle and I'm not opposed to the pragmatic
21 approach, but I would wish to have the opportunity,
22 extremely briefly, to make a submission that deals with,
23 in a sense, the bridge between the principle and the
24 pragmatism.

25 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Of course.

1 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: In my submission, the position originally
2 adopted by Mr Keith is not, in fact, sustainable and it
3 depends upon a false distinction which is drawn between
4 evidence which is admissible in proceedings, which, on
5 his analysis, the press is entitled to report and
6 everything else which is communicated in open court,
7 which I infer, on his analysis, the press isn't entitled
8 to report, and in my respectful submission that
9 distinction has no foundation.

10 The press is entitled to report anything that is
11 communicated in open court, whether it's communicated by
12 way of evidence, whether it's communicated by way of
13 submissions, whether it's the conduct of a judge,
14 whether it's the conduct of a witness, whether it's
15 something that happens in court, like a disturbance.

16 The media is entitled to report all of those matters,
17 and the only matters that the court is empowered to
18 prevent the media reporting, if I can put it like that,
19 are those which cause really substantial prejudice to
20 the administration of justice, and those powers, in this
21 era, are now confined to the Contempt of Court Act 1981
22 because it's now well-established by the Privy Council
23 in the Independent Publishing court case, which was
24 referred to by Mr Dodd, that essentially there is no
25 common law power of general application to prevent the

1 media from reporting anything. It has to be founded now
2 in statute, and that statute is the Contempt of Court
3 Act 1981.

4 What that means in practice, in a case like this, is
5 that, unless you've got a postponement power under
6 section 4 of the 1981 Act, or a power to prevent
7 something from being published at all under section 11,
8 there is no power to stop the media from publishing it,
9 and if that means that something is inadvertently shown
10 on a screen, which everybody gets to see, the public and
11 the press, and that means that if something is
12 inadvertently shown in open court and everybody reads it
13 and everybody knows what it is, there is, in fact, no
14 power, unless it exists under the Contempt of Court Act,
15 to prevent the media from going out and reporting it.

16 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: That's quite an extreme argument,
17 Mr Vassell-Adams. So the fact that Mr Keith puts on the
18 screen a document which could have been completely
19 blanked out, except for the passage he read out, you say
20 the right to report everything communicated in court
21 covers passages that weren't communicated in court, they
22 merely appeared on the screen unblanked out?

23 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: I think my position is that they are
24 communicated in court if they're shown in court on
25 a screen which the public and the press can see.

1 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: But I didn't look at them, I was
2 looking at the passage to which Mr Keith referred me and
3 I'm the one to whom the communications are being made.

4 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: Well, my Lady, the communications are
5 being made to your Ladyship. They're also being made to
6 the parties and they're being made to the public, and
7 one is always reluctant to ask a rhetorical question,
8 but my rhetorical question would be: if there is
9 a power, I would like to know where the power is found,
10 because in my respectful submission, once it's been
11 communicated in open court, unless it would be
12 a contempt of court to publish it -- and those
13 circumstances are, indeed, very limited now -- the media
14 is entitled to publish it.

15 So my position on the principles is clear, but as
16 a pragmatic way forward, for dealing with this issue of
17 the text messages, I welcome the concession and I do not
18 press your Ladyship to make a ruling.

19 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I'm very grateful, Mr Vassell-Adams.
20 It is a fascinating line of argument, but I am ever the
21 pragmatist, given there are so many very important
22 issues in these inquest proceedings. I am persuaded,
23 having seen the text messages for myself, that text
24 messages sent on the operational phones, a record of
25 which appeared on the screen, between some or all of the

1 four men, and particularly the ones in the days leading
2 up to the bombing, are plainly relevant and would be
3 admissible. I understand Ms Gallagher in any event
4 intends possibly to adduce some of them in evidence and,
5 therefore, I will quash my former ruling and my ruling
6 now is that the document containing the texts may be
7 published on the website and may be published by the
8 press.

9 MR KEITH: Thank you very much, my Lady, and would my Lady
10 rule that, in general terms, subject to specific
11 objection and subject, of course, to any specific future
12 ruling, that where reference is made to a page appearing
13 on the Lextranet system, and where reference is made to
14 a particular part of that page, the whole of the page
15 will henceforth be deemed relevant and admissible and
16 would appear, therefore, in the public website?

17 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: With some misgivings, because it does
18 mean that people are going to have to be very cautious
19 what documents are put up and any objections lodged very
20 quickly so you'll need to ensure that all your
21 colleagues are informed. I will rule in that way for
22 the present, but as I say, I think that others may want
23 to think about whether it might lead to problems.

24 I appreciate the difficulties in redacting every
25 document and I don't want to make the task of the

1 Inquest team any worse and I certainly don't want to
2 cause the kind of problems the media face when suddenly
3 they see a document and they're not sure whether they
4 can report it or not.

5 MR KEITH: Quite so.

6 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Again, as a pragmatic solution,
7 I will say, yes, that can happen, but I may have to
8 revisit it if any problems arise.

9 MR KEITH: My Lady, yes. I particularly will take further
10 care in future to ensure that we see on the screen
11 material that is directly relevant rather than ancillary
12 material and I won't respond to the torment from behind
13 me by way of the principled arguments on that point.

14 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I fear you two will have to save that
15 for another day, Mr Keith.

16 MR KEITH: We could go on for hours.

17 My Lady, the CCTV.

18 The current position -- of course, Mr Vassell-Adams
19 is here to address that point as well --

20 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Just before you go on, Mr Tibber, I'm
21 sorry to come back to you again, especially if
22 Mrs Gallagher is on her way, there were possible -- ah,
23 she's here.

24 I'm terribly sorry, we carried on without you,

25 Ms Gallagher. We appreciate you were told 4.30, so

1 please don't feel in any way awkward.

2 MR TIBBER: My Lady, if you will, I will deal with this
3 because this relates clearly to a change of instructions
4 that -- we have assumed that's where you're going with
5 this. We have had a change of instructions since
6 I emailed Mr Smith with the objections to the full CCTV
7 being made public. I can put it as simply as I put it
8 in an earlier email today, which is that those
9 instructions have changed and, in fact, amongst the
10 clients there are, as you anticipated, varying degrees
11 of responses, some of which are not to take part in the
12 process at all, some of which are with some hesitation.
13 But the most forceful of which are that the public
14 should be made aware of the full atrocity of the day and
15 that the CCTV footage should be released.

16 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Thank you, Mr Tibber. I think we
17 need to make it clear here we're not talking about the
18 completely unedited versions. As I understand it --
19 Mr Hill will correct me, if I'm wrong -- we have, as it
20 were, three versions of the recordings. One is the
21 full, totally unedited recordings of the dreadful scene.
22 Nobody has suggested that that should be shown.
23 We then have the first edited version which includes
24 personal effects and some bloodstaining, and then we
25 have -- which is the version that I have seen -- we then

1 have the third version, which Mr Hill was suggesting
2 would be the version the press should be allowed to use,
3 and that is version where bloodstaining and personal
4 effects have been removed.

5 You are content that the second -- or those you
6 represent are content that the second version should be
7 shown by the press and on the public website?

8 MR TIBBER: My Lady, that is right. I should record that
9 the reason for the initial objections was that, on first
10 sighting of the edited CCTV, it did cause some distress
11 to see loved ones' personal items, personal belongings,
12 there. We are very much comforted by the -- I think it
13 is the final paragraph of the submissions on behalf of
14 the press, that they will be sensitive to how much of
15 that they are prepared to reproduce, and it's to some
16 extent in reliance upon that assurance that we withdraw
17 our objection to the edited CCTV being released.

18 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Mr Tibber, the only problem with
19 that, of course, is that you are dealing with a number
20 of organisations and unless you're going to speak to
21 each of them individually, they need to know where they
22 stand. It's rather difficult to say you're relying upon
23 what is a general assurance that they will be sensitive
24 when, at the moment, I don't think they know in respect
25 of what items they have to be sensitive.

1 MR TIBBER: My Lady, we have had discussions with some of
2 them --

3 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Right.

4 MR TIBBER: -- and I think most of them are probably aware
5 of the objections that we have raised.

6 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Thank you, then, Mr Tibber.

7 Mr Taylor, you're not represented. I don't know
8 if -- you have been, I know, following proceedings
9 carefully. I don't know if there's anybody else who's
10 unrepresented here this afternoon. Did you understand
11 what I was saying about the three versions of the tapes
12 that we're talking about?

13 MR TAYLOR: Yes.

14 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: There's no suggestion of seeing the
15 tapes with bodies in them. The question at the moment
16 is whether the tape that goes on the public website is
17 the tape that shows some bloodstaining, it's not clear
18 whose, but some blood and some personal effects, or
19 whether it's the tape that has none of that in it, it's
20 just really much more general, keeps cutting in and out,
21 and doesn't have those personal effects and the
22 bloodstaining in.

23 I don't know if you or Mrs Taylor have any comments
24 you would want to make?

25 MR TAYLOR: From our point of view and I should think for

1 most others, the bereaved families, any views of
2 personal items and bloodstaining would be totally
3 distressing to them, so I respectfully submit to you
4 that that's not used at all, we go for the third option.

5 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: So you would prefer it if it was the
6 version that the press already had access to rather than
7 the one that would show personal effects?

8 MR TAYLOR: Yes, indeed I do.

9 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Right.

10 Who's going first? Mr Vassell-Adams, are you going
11 first?

12 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: I'll be guided by your Ladyship.

13 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I am just thinking, it is now 4.20.
14 I didn't give anybody a break. How long do you think
15 this is going to take?

16 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: I'm reluctant to say because I have a bad
17 track record of underestimating on this score. I have
18 no doubt that there will be others who will raise issues
19 in relation to arguments I've raised and then I may wish
20 to respond to that. I would have thought I could tailor
21 my submissions to make them twenty minutes.

22 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: This argument must take at least an
23 hour, mustn't it?

24 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: I think that's realistic.

25 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I think, having seen now where

1 everybody stands, I'm afraid this argument must go off
2 until tomorrow. I don't think it's fair on the staff
3 and everybody else who's had such a long day. So I'll
4 hear this argument at 10.00 tomorrow.

5 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: My Lady, may I raise a small personal
6 matter? I raise this with some reluctance. I'm
7 actually the sole carer of a two-year-old girl at the
8 moment because my wife is working abroad this week.
9 10.00 is challenging for me, very challenging, and if it
10 were possible for this argument to be heard at 10.30
11 I would be grateful. I'm not saying that I could not
12 make it for 10.00, but I have certain practical
13 difficulties.

14 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: I'll leave you to discuss with
15 Mr Keith and Mr Smith and everybody else whether there's
16 any material we can do and then come to the argument,
17 but there are so many people involved, Mr Vassell-Adams,
18 I'm afraid I will be sitting at 10.00 and I'll wait,
19 when I come into court, we'll either deal with this
20 argument or, if it's possible to do other matters, then
21 I'll try to help, having been in that position myself.

22 MR KEITH: My Lady, may I make a suggestion? There are two
23 witnesses tomorrow, both of whom suffered grievously and
24 I'm very concerned that, if at all possible, we should
25 not delay the receipt of their evidence, but might

1 I suggest instead that my Lady consider, if my learned
2 friend was available, his arguments at 12.30?
3 My track record is such that it may be that we will
4 finish tomorrow morning's evidence a little bit before
5 the short adjournment, which may allow the argument to
6 start, if not to conclude, if we commence it at 12.30,
7 and my Lady could then conclude it in the afternoon when
8 the witnesses are less likely to be so severely troubled
9 by their injuries.

10 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Mr Vassell-Adams, as far as those
11 organisations you represented are concerned, provided
12 they get a decision sooner rather than later, the actual
13 exact timing is not making any difference, is that
14 right?

15 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: That is correct.

16 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Well, again, I will leave court,
17 leave you to discuss the matter. If my saying I will
18 hear this argument not before 12.00 or not before 12.30
19 means that we can get distressed witnesses in and out of
20 the witness-box, causing them the least inconvenience as
21 possible, then I think that would be a better idea.
22 So I'll leave it to you all to decide on the timing,
23 but I will deal with this argument during the course of
24 tomorrow. It's just a question of at what time.

25 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: Thank you, my Lady.

1 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: May I ask you, if you would, to talk
2 to Mr Taylor, because it's important that Mr and
3 Mrs Taylor aren't left out of what's going on, and it
4 may be that you can discuss with them what might cause
5 them particular concern, but I'll need to know tomorrow
6 what everybody's final position is.

7 MR VASSELL-ADAMS: I probably ought to say this in open
8 court as opposed to directly to one person. What we
9 indicated at the end of our skeleton argument, which was
10 without prejudice to our argument that we're entitled to
11 all the footage, is that if specific parts of the
12 footage were identified by particular affected
13 individuals and identified with precision and amounted
14 to not a great deal of the available footage, we would
15 do our very best to respect that.

16 That applies to any of the families, and not only
17 those who are represented.

18 Now, those discussions can take place.

19 LADY JUSTICE HALLETT: Thank you all. I'll sit again at
20 10.00 and I await to see which matters we will be
21 turning to next. Thank you.

22 (4.25 pm)

23 (The inquests adjourned until 10.00 am the following day)

24

25